**INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING**

***External Expert Panel***

**To IAAR Accreditation Council**

****

**REPORT**

**on the results of work of the External Expert Panel on assessment for conformance to the requirements of IAAR Standards and Guidelines**

**for international accreditation of medical institutions of education abroad**

**(based on WFME/ AMSE standards) of**

**Kharkiv National Medical University**

**within the period of November 23 - November 25, 2020**

**Kharkiv November 25, 2020**

**CONTENTS**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| (1)ABBREVIATIONS……………………………………………………………………... | **3** |
| (II) INTRODUCTION……………………………………………………………………. | **4** |
| (III) PRESENTATION OF THE MEDICAL INSTITUTION OF EDUCATION…… | **4** |
| (IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE……. | **5** |
| (V) EEP VISIT DESCRIPTION…………………………………………………………. | **5** |
| (VI) CONFORMANCE TO THE INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS……………………………………………………………………………… | **6** |
| ***6.1. Standard MISSION AND OUTCOMES……………………………………………*** | **6** |
| ***6.2. Standard EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM…………………………………………...*** | **8** |
| ***6.3. Standard STUDENT ASSESSMENT……………………………………………….*** | **11** |
| ***6.4. Standard STUDENTS………………………………………………………………..*** | **15** |
| ***6.5. Standard ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY………………………………………...*** | **17** |
| ***6.6. Standard EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES…………………………………………*** | **19** |
| ***6.7. Standard PROGRAM EVALUATION……………………………………………...*** | **21** |
| ***6.8. Standard MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION…………………………..*** | **24** |
| ***6.9. Standard CONTINUOUS UPDATE………………………………………………...*** | **26** |
| (VII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD…... | **28** |
| (VIII) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS ON QUALITY ASSURANCE FOR EACH STANDARD………………………………………………………………………. | **30** |
| (IX) RECOMMENDATION TO ACCREDITATION BOARD……………………….. | **31** |
| Appendix 1. INSTITUTIONAL PROFILE PARAMETERS…………………………. | **32** |
| Appendix 2. PROGRAM OF VISIT TO INSTITUTION OF EDUCATION |  |
| Appendix 3. RESULTS OF ACADEMIC STAFF SURVEY |  |
| Appendix 4. RESULTS OF STUDENTS SURVEY |  |

1. **ABBREVIATIONS**

ACS - automatic control system

AS – academic staff

CGSE - complete general secondary education

CMU - Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine

CPP – Chornobyl Power Plant

ECTS – European Credit Transfer System

EEP – external expert panel

EP – educational program

EPP - educational professional program

ERIEQ –KhNMU Education and Research Institute of Education Quality

ERITIC - KhNMU Education and Research Institute for Training International Citizens

ERPA – Education-Research-Production Association

HEI – higher education institution

IHE – institution of higher education

KhMI – Kharkiv Medical Institute

KhNMU – Kharkiv National Medical University

KhSMU – Kharkiv State Medical University

KRSA - Kharkiv Regional State Administration

LU - Law of Ukraine

MES - Ministry of Education and Science

mini-CEX -Mini-Clinical Evaluation Exercise

NAMS – National Academy of Medical Sciences

OSCE – objective structured clinical examination

SIW - students' independent work

1. **INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with the order of the IAAR General Director No. 119-20 OD dated 10.11.20, KhNMU hosted a visit of the external expert panel (EEC) from November 23 to November 25, 2020.

The university's compliance with the IAAR institutional accreditation standards was assessed:

Panel Chair - Janis Zalkans, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Riga Stradins University (Riga, Republic of Latvia);

Expert - Sydykova Saule Ilyasovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, provost of NpJSC "Astana Medical University" (Nur-Sultan);

Expert - Konrad Juszkiewicz, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, KIT Royal Tropical Institute (Amsterdam, the Netherlands);

Employer - Ryaba Natalia Sergeevna, a network of clinics "Lumi-dent" (Kiev, Ukraine);

Student - Filenko Yana, Kharkiv Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education (Kharkiv, Ukraine);

Observer from the Agency - Aimurzieva Aigerim Urinbaevna, Head of medical projects of the Agency (Nur-Sultan).

The EEP report contains an assessment of the compliance of the educational organization with the IAAR criteria, the EEP's recommendations for the further improvement of the university.

**(III) PRESENTATION OF THE MEDICAL INSTITUTION OF EDUCATION**

Kharkiv National Medical University dates back to 1804, when the Imperial University was created by the Decree of Emperor Alexander I. That time the university included the Faculty of Medicine, the legal successor of which in 1920 was Kharkiv Medical Academy, formed by merger of the Faculty of Medicine with the Women's Medical Institute (founded in Kharkiv in 1910). In 1921, the Medical Academy was reorganized into Kharkiv Medical Institute.

In February 1992, KhMI was the first among the medical universities of Ukraine to pass certification by the inspection of higher educational institutions under the Ministry of Education of Ukraine, which adopted Resolution No. 3-4/240 dated March 25, 1992 "On the results of certification of Kharkiv Medical Institute". According to this Resolution, KhMI was recognized as a certified institution of education.

In January 1993, by the decision of the Interdisciplinary Accreditation Commission, approved by the commission of the Ministry of Education dated 24.03.93 (protocol No. 10/3), KhMI was entered into the state register of educational institutions with granting a license for the right to carry out educational activities at the 4th level of accreditation in the areas and within the licensed volumes of admission.

By the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine dated April 20, 1994 No. 244 "On improving the network of higher educational institutions", KhMI was reorganized into a state medical university.

KhSMU was assigned the status of National by the Decree of the President of Ukraine No. 1135/2007 dated November 22, 2007.

By the decision of the accreditation commission of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine dated March 29, 2013 (Protocol No. 102), KhNMU was granted the right to train foreign citizens in basic major fields, prepare them for admission to Ukrainian universities, as well as post-graduate professional training.

The university includes 8 faculties: the Faculty of Medicine No. 1 (major fields General Medicine, Medicine), the Faculty of Medicine No. 2 (major fields Genera Medicine, Medicine), the Faculty of Medicine No. 3 (major fields Medicine, Pediatrics, Nursing, Social Work), the Faculty of Medicine No. 4 (major fields Medicine, Preventive Medicine, Technology of Medical Diagnosis and Treatment, Physical Rehabilitation, Physical Therapy, Ergotherapy, Public Health), the Faculty of Dentistry (major field Dentistry), three faculties which are part of KhNMU ERITIC – Faculty for Training International Students No. 5 (major fields General Medicine, Medicine, Dentistry), Faculty for Training International Students No. 6 (major fields General Medicine, Medicine, Dentistry), Faculty for Training International Students No. 7 (major fields Genera Medicine, Medicine). Besides the university has Education and Research Institute for Postgraduate Training (is engaged in postgraduate training of specialists as well as training in major fields Public Administration and Educational Sciences). The University also has Medical Professional College (training junior specialist in major field Nursing)

1. **DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE**

It is the first time that KhNMU undergoes institutional accreditation according to IAAR standards.

1. **EEP VISIT DESCRIPTION**

The EEP work was carried out in accordance with the program of the visit of the Expert Panel on institutional accreditation at KhNMU from 23 to 25 November 2020.

To obtain objective information about the quality of the institution of education, development of the university and infrastructure, clarification of the self-assessment report content, meetings with the rector, pro-rectors, department directors, department chairs, teaching staff, students, employers, and graduates took place. Total 163 persons took part in the meetings.

According to the results of the anonymous online survey, satisfaction of both teachers and students with working and learning conditions in this university can be noted. The anonymous survey enrolled 91 persons of KhNMU academic staff and 105 students.

**Table 1. Information about the categories of the meetings participants**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| ***Participant category*** | ***Number*** |
| Rector | 1 |
| Pro-rectors | 6 |
| Academic Board Chair | 1 |
| Deans | 8 |
| Heads of divisions | 11 |
| Educational program guarantors | 17 |
| Department chairpersons | 23 |
| Teachers | 27 |
| Students | 29 |
| Graduates | 30 |
| Employers | 10 |
| **Total** | **163** |

As the EEP worked in a distant format, the Panel familiarized with the university using the presented videos: university buildings, educational laboratories, classrooms, library, simulation center and phantom classroom, educational museums of anatomy and pathology and the sports complex. The inspection of the above buildings was carried out on video call. Also, the documentation of the university faculties was studied by the links. By video call the clinical sites, Education and Research Medical Complex "University Hospital", University Dental Center were inspected.

During the visit, according to the program, the EEP members attended the classes according to the approved schedule. All inspected premises are equipped with the necessary equipment for all types of courses: projector, projection screen, access to the Internet and suitable furniture. The premises for training sessions are equipped in accordance with the types of activities and meet the standards and norms specific for medical education in all disciplines of the curriculum requiring laboratory studies. The equipment allows achievement of the goals of each discipline.

The EEP members (by video call) met with the directors of the clinical sites, students who talked about the requirements for students, about the process of passing the work placement process. It should be noted that the clinical sites provide effective work placement, take part in the assessment of knowledge, skills and abilities of the students. During the visit, the directors of the clinical sites noted close cooperation with the university in terms of clinical training of students. Thus, the evidence of clinical training and work placement were obtained.

**(VI) COMPLIENCE WITH INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION STANDARDS**

***6.1. Standard MISSION AND OUTCOMES***

***Evidentiary section***

The activities of the University are aimed at implementation of the mission, which includes creation of educational and scientific values in the field of health care, promotion of health care development in accordance with the needs and tendencies of modern society, socio-economic situation, providing applicants for education with high-quality educational services to acquire appropriate competencies and ensure their competitiveness in the domestic and international labor markets.

**The strategic objectives of** KhNMU **development** for the period up to 2025 correspond to the mission of the University.

The mission, vision, strategic objectives of the university correspond to the goals, objectives and priorities of the national education system.

The mission and vision of KhNMU are published in the framework of the Concept of Kharkiv National Medical University Development for 2015-2025, developed in accordance with the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education", the Reform Strategy for Higher Education in Ukraine until 2020, the National Strategy for Building of New Healthcare System in Ukraine for 2015-2025, Concept of the National Program "Health 2020: Ukrainian Dimension". Also, in the development and implementation of the university's mission, the Concept of development of public health system (2016) and program "Health 2020 – European framework of policy and strategy for the 21st century (2013).

The mission reflects medical needs of the region and health care system as a whole, as well as the goals and strategy of the educational process, which allow preparing highly qualified specialists relevant to the high and dynamically changing conditions of the labor market. The graduates are able to work in a team, are motivated to continue their education throughout their lives and ready for continuous professional growth.

The mission of KhNMU is presented on the website and in the main regulatory documents of the university, brought to the attention of all interested parties (MHU, MESU, academic community, university staff and students, potential applicants, healthcare professionals, the public).

The educational strategy of the institution contributes to the development of further career in any field of medicine, including all types of medical practice, administrative medicine and scientific research in medicine.

In KhNMU, the achievements of both national and foreign medical science are successfully and systematically included in the educational process. Proper attention is given to behavioral and social science issues.

The university provides not only professional, but also personal growth of the students.

Global health issues are reviewed and major international health problems are reflected in the educative process at all stages.

The analysis of the constituent documents has shown that KhNMU has a sufficient degree of institutional autonomy in order to develop and implement quality assurance policy, for which the administration and tutors are responsible.

The procedures for internal quality assurance of KhNMU educational programs include the analysis of internal and external environment: sociological monitoring of the opinions of students, teachers, employers and other stakeholders; making management decisions through detection and analysis of problems.

The University uses the results of assessment of the competencies of the graduates as a feedback tool for further development and improvement of the educational program.

***Analytical section***

According to the criteria of the standard “Mission and Outcomes”, KhNMU holds the mission and brings it to the stakeholders. The mission is reflected in the Concept of Kharkiv National Medical University Development for 2015-2025.

To achieve the mission, the university has the institutional freedom to develop educational programs, it continuously builds up material and technical facilities, increases international cooperation, which was proved by the documents and at the meetings with the university staff, AS and students.

Analysis of the documents, the results of the meetings of the EEP members with the administration of the university, directors of institutes, deans of the faculties, department chairpersons, representatives of the professional community, employers and alumni made it possible to establish a high degree of compliance with the criteria of the standard "Mission and Outcomes".

During questionnaire survey of AS, 80% of the respondents demonstrated their commitment to the profession of a doctor and the university, as one of the best medical universities in Ukraine.

At the same time, the university should pay attention to involvement of the main stakeholders for participation in the discussion and revision of the mission, and specifically by the way of regulation and rewards.

***Strengths/best practice***

* Education quality assurance system.
* Institutional freedom for development of educational programs with a choice of forms of organization of the educational process and teaching methods.
* Sufficient material and technical, organizational, informational, methodological framework that forms the potential for the implementation of the university's mission.
* KhNMU assists in the introduction of innovations in the educational process, allowing the development of more extensive and specialized competencies than those defined as basic competencies.

***EEP recommendations***

In the process of development and revision of EP, it is necessary to additionally involve employers in the evaluation and revision of the final learning outcomes for educational programs.

***EEP conclusions on the grounds of criteria (strong/satisfactory/expect improvement/unsatisfactory)***

strong – 0

satisfactory – 22

expect improvement – 1

unsatisfactory – 0.

***6.2. Standard EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM***

***Evidentiary section***

The educational process at KhNMU is carried out in accordance with the legal acts and sublegislative regulations of Ukraine.

All levels of undergraduate, graduate and postgraduate education are represented at the University: – language training (preparatory faculty, pre-university education for foreign students); – professional pre-higher education (medical professional college of KhNMU, "Nursing", 3 specializations); – higher education (bachelors and masters) – "Medicine" ("General Medicine"), "Dentistry", "Pediatrics", "Nursing", "Technologies of medical diagnosis and treatment", "Physical therapy, occupational therapy", "Educational, pedagogical sciences", "Public health", "Public management and administration", "Physical rehabilitation", "Social work"; – internship in 27 specialties; - preparation of doctors of philosophy (PhD) and doctoral programs – 4 specialties ("Medicine", "Pediatrics", "Dentistry", "Technologies of medical diagnosis and treatment"), 27 specializations; – postgraduate training, cycles of specialization and internships in 48 medical specialties.

The criteria of Standard 2 were considered through the example of the educational and professional program (EPP) “Medicine” of the second (master's) level, major field 222 "Medicine", field of knowledge 22 "Health", developed on the basis of the norms determined by the National Qualifications Framework.

The model of EPP "Medicine" for the 1st-3rd years is built on the "tape" and block-module principles; for 4th-6th years – on the module-cycle principle by the way of rotation of modules. EPP "Medicine" includes disciplines of humanitarian and socio-economic training, fundamental disciplines (biomedical sciences), as well as the disciplines of professional training. The disciplines are divided into compulsory and elective with an indication of the value in ECTS credits.

The basic teaching technologies include lectures, practical classes, work placement (patient care, nursing, medical), independent work and participation in scientific research via scientific societies. The opportunity for self-training is provided in classrooms, specialized simulation classes, the Scientific Library with educational and methodological literature and scientific resources of KhNMU Repository, as well as through the e-learning system Moodle in a convenient mode.

According to the certificate, EP "Medicine" is based on a competency-based approach with learning outcomes in the disciplines. The student responsibility for education is supported by the organization of independent work and classical training on clinical competencies at the patient's bedside.

The Charter and the Code of Corporate Ethics of KhNMU confirm providing equal access to education; absence of discrimination based on nationality, sex, religion, language; availability of conditions for receiving higher education for orphans, children deprived of parental care and children with disabilities; observance of the principles of democracy, transparency and publicity in the formation of the student body, amongst other things by objective testing. Prevention of cases of discriminatory behavior among all participants of the educational process is regulated by the Statute.

The principles of scientific methodology, including the methods of analytical and critical thinking of the EPP "Medicine", are implemented through the disciplines of the mandatory component:

"Social medicine, public health and scientific research methods in medicine" (3rd, 4th, 6th years of study; 9 ECTS credits), "Epidemiology and principles of evidence-based medicine" (5th year of study; 3 ECTS credits);

and elective components:

"Methodology of Evidence-Based Medicine" (4th year of study; 3 ECTS credits), "Methods of Epidemiology in Clinical Medicine, "Fundamentals of Evidence-Based Medicine" (6th year, 3.0 ECTS credits).

For the formation of students' understanding of scientific knowledge KhNMU involves them in participation in research projects, the annual Festival of Youth Science, the All-Ukrainian Congress of Student Scientific Societies and Societies of Young Scientists of Medical (Pharmaceutical) Institutions of Higher Education, Medical (Pharmaceutical) Faculties of Universities, the Festival of Universal Scientific Education and Research Network USERN (2018), All-Ukrainian student Olympiad in disciplines: "Medical Genetics", "Clinical Immunology and Allergology", "Psychiatry and Addiction Medicine" (for students of medical universities) and "Medical Psychology" (for medical and classic universities), international conferences of young scientists and students, etc.

In order to increase the efficiency of training, the anatomical visualization system Anatomage table 6.0 convertible, synthetic human cadaver Syndaver and interactive whiteboards are used. Trinocular microscopes GranumR04 and GranumR06 are used in the study of the discipline "Histology, cytology and embryology"; multimedia complex "Microscope with access to the internet-laptop-monitor", what allows to convey an image of histological specimens remotely in real time.

5610 academic hours are assigned to the study of the main clinical disciplines, which include lectures, practical exercises, SIW and clinical practice. The students spend at least a third of the study hours in direct contact with patients: they participate in rounds, clinical examinations, clinical and pathology conferences, take part in completing medical documentation followed by a discussion of its quality.

Patient safety is guaranteed by supporting appropriate corporate culture, health of students and teachers, training on the basis of specialized simulation classes.

When considering issues related to diagnostic and therapeutic strategies at the clinical departments of various specialties for the 4th-6th year students, national and international standards of medical care are followed.

The curricula of the disciplines are subject to annual revision before the beginning of an academic year. Due to the difficult situation in the east of Ukraine, the program includes topics on the organization of anti-epidemic protection of the population in emergency situations, the discipline "Military Epidemiology" has been introduced, the course "Military Hygiene" has been introduced for the 4th year students. Changes are made to the content of the clinical disciplines of the EPP "Medicine" in accordance with the demands of the health care system: the topics "Specific features of the management of patients with arterial hypertension under the conditions of the COVID-19 pandemic", "Specific features of the management of patients with coronary heart disease under the conditions of the COVID-19 pandemic", "Specific features of the management of patients with chronic heart failure under the conditions of the COVID-19 pandemic", "Specific features of the management of patients with connective tissue diseases under the conditions of the COVID-19 pandemic", "Tactical management of the patients with comorbid pathology under the conditions of the COVID-19 pandemic” have been included in the discipline "Internal medicine".

On the basis of the EPP "Medicine" the curriculum is being developed, which specifies the list of subjects, number of hours and its distribution to classroom hours and SIW, distribution of the workload by semesters. The mandatory components of the EP are grouped into categories – humanitarian and socio-economic training, natural science training, professional training.

Education under the EPP "Medicine" lasts for 6 years, the volume of the EPP is 360 ECTS credits (one year of study – 60 ECTS credits), 5549 hours are assigned to face-to-face training with a teacher, 5631 hours are intended for SIW of the total number of hours (11180). The academic year lasts for from 37 to 39 weeks, depending on the year of study, and is divided into two terms. An average number of hours per week is 23-25. The information about the EPP is placed on the KhNMU website to provide an opportunity to inform all stakeholders (academic community, including students, employers).

The EPP was built in accordance with the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System, focused on the possibility of recognition of students' academic achievements, regardless of the place of study and taking into account the requirements of the European Union Directive on the recognition of professional qualifications from 2005 (No. 2005/36/EC as amended by the European Union Directive 2013/55 / EC). Optional disciplines for students make up 25.3%.

For the disciplines of humanitarian and social training 12 credits (3.3%) are assigned, which is 680 hours and makes the basis for the formation of general competencies. 70 credits (2100 hours), which is 19.4% of the total number of EPP credits, are assigned to biomedical sciences, the purpose of which is to study the theoretical issues, necessary further to achieve professional competencies. For clinical disciplines necessary for the development and improvement of professional competencies, 187 credits (52%) are assigned, which is 5610 hours. 18 credits of the total number of EPP credits are assigned to the internship. 5549 hours are assigned for face-to-face training of the teacher and the student for the EPP "Medicine".

The university constantly increases its resources to obtain practical clinical experience by the students through the development of clinical sites. The University has concluded 127 agreements on cooperation with 79 health care institutions, which are the clinical sites of the University, training is performed on the basis of 3 scientific and practical medical centers of the University (university clinics).

In the 6th year of study, students, with the option of choice of one of four profiles (44 ECTS credits each) in the context of the future specialization "Family Medicine", "Internal Medicine", "Surgery", "Obstetrics and Gynecology" master the skills necessary for the internship. The internship is a compulsory form of postgraduate training and is completed through the state certification with issuance of a primary specialization certificate.

***Analytical section***

The self-assessment report according to the "Educational program" standard is confirmed by the results of focus group interviews, meet the criteria of the standard and demonstrate the mastery of professional and general competences by students based on the gradual complication of the process of basic knowledge acquisition, preceding the clinic, integration of the disciplines horizontally and vertically and readiness for internship.

The results of the questionnaire survey of AS showed a high level of satisfaction with the content of EP (72.5%), an ability to use their own strategies (72.5%), their own methods (82.4%), own innovations in teaching (74.7%), advertency of the university administration to EP content (73.6%), administration support in the development of new EP (81.3%).

At the same time, the university should pay attention to availability of training in medical educational programs within the framework of inclusive education.

The principles of scientific methodology, including the methods of analytical and critical thinking are mastered by the students mainly in scientific societies, which is not included in the learning outcomes of mandatory or elective components of the EP for the entire student population.

***Strengths/best practice***

The strengths of the standard "Educational program" include the potential of the academic and teaching staff with the confirmed level of scientific and professional activity, approaches to program management at all levels of the university – departments, dean's offices, boards of faculties, institutes, central methodological commission, Academic Board and strong ties of the university with practical health care.

***EEP recommendations***

1. In order to increase availability of education for the persons with disabilities, it is recommended to create favorable conditions: career guidance, adapted teaching methods and curriculum, relations between students, teachers and others with informing the population on possibilities of inclusive medical education.

2. In order to form analytical and critical thinking and reflect them in the final learning outcomes of the EP, mastering the basics and principles of scientific methodology within the framework of mandatory and/or optional components should be provided.

***EEP conclusions on the grounds of criteria (strong/satisfactory/expect improvement /unsatisfactory)***

strong – 3

satisfactory – 38

expect improvement – 2

unsatisfactory – 0.

***6.3***. ***Standard STUDENT ASSESSMENT***

***Evidentiary section***

At KhNMU different grading scales are applied: a 200-point grading scale, a four-point marking scale (excellent, good, satisfactory, unsatisfactory) and the ECTS grading scale (A, B, C, D, E, F, Fx). The assessment results are converted from one scale to another.

KhNMU employs the European credit transfer system of educational process organization; its use is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of education and science of Ukraine, dated October 16, 2009, № 943.

As a part of the implementation of this Order, the methodology and an assessment system to evaluate the results of training according to the relevant educational program, is regulated at the University by a number of internal instructional guidance documents: “Regulations on the organization of the educational process at KhNMU”, “Regulations on certification at KhNMU”, “Instructions as to the assessment of educational activities of students in correspondence with the European credit transfer system (ECTS) applied in KhNMU to organize the educational process”, which were adopted by the Academic Council of the University and approved by the Order of the Rector.

At KhNMU, the student assessment is carried out by means of oral or written examination, computer tests or written tests, when examining practical skills with the use of simulation techniques or as a part of clinical examination of the patient. Students’ learning outcomes, including the independent work, as well as the skills acquired, are checked and evaluated during a semester, an academic year and the entire period of training. It is done in the form of a continuous assessment, as well as it is presented by the results of pass-fail exams, graded tests and result-rating examinations in accordance with the curriculum and academic schedule.

The final grade for each discipline is compiled of the current academic performance of the student, marks for the individual work and the results of the summative assessment.

Each department determines its own methods to monitor current and final academic performance of the students, which allows assessing the learning outcomes and acquired competencies, defined in the course syllabus. Tests are taken at the last practical class of the discipline.

The record keeping is registered in the KhNMU electronic students’ progress record by the automatic control system (ACS KhNMU), in paper gradebooks at the departments, in examination record lists, in a student academic card, in a student record book and in a student’s individual plan.

The final examination is taken by an examination board, which includes the university professors, who present the University departments, granted with academic and research and academic degree, and an academic status, as well as the practicing specialists.

The students, who have fulfilled all the requirements of the syllabus in every discipline due to a certain level of higher education are admitted to the Final Certifying Examination (Regulations on the organization and holding of the graduates’ certification in Kharkiv National Medical University in accordance with the Order No. 53, dated February 26, 2016).

As a means of an external evaluation, an independent test (ministerial) is held, which is done in the form of Test-Based Licensing Integrated Exams “KROK 1” and “KROK 2” (“Step 1” and “Step 2”). They are carried out by the state organization “Test Center for the Assessment of Professional Competence of Specialists with Higher Education Majoring in “Medicine” and “Pharmacy” under the Ministry of Health in Ukraine.

The exam is held in two stages: the first stage – in the 3rd year of study, when the students are examined in 9 medical and biological subjects (anatomy, biology, histology, normal physiology, microbiology, biochemistry, pathological physiology, pathological anatomy, pharmacology), the second stage – at (graduation) 5 or 6th year of study at a dental or a medical faculty. The assessment criterion of the licensed integrated exam “passed” / “failed” is the percentage of correct answers to standardized test questions in profile disciplines, which makes 60.5% of the correct answers.

The University provides a procedure to retake the course assessment in case of an unsatisfactory result, but no more than two times. First – to the research and training staff member of the department, who carried out the exam, second time – to the committee, which is created by the Order of the Rector.

The results of the end-of the semester assessment are discussed at the meetings of the departments, by the University authorities, at the meetings of the Academic Boards of faculties (institutes) and the Academic Board of the University. They are one of the important factors in providing the quality of the educational process at the University.

The learning outcomes are subdivided into three categories – knowledge, skills, competences. Each EP contains a general list of knowledge, skills, competencies, which have to be mastered by the student as a result of the training. The Program for each discipline reflects the list of knowledge, skills, competencies that have to be mastered by the student as a result of learning a specific discipline. Forms and methods of the assessment vary depending on the goals set.

The reliability of the assessment is ensured by the evaluation of test assignments, analysis of the test results, calculation of psychometric test indicators and test assignments, preparation of a statistical test certificate, making of the reports on the test results, cross-assessment within the department.

The University has developed and has launched “Regulations on the appeal as to the results of the final assessment of degree-seeking students at Kharkiv National Medical University”. If the student is not satisfied with the assessment results, he may submit an application to the dean of the faculty. At the suggestion of the dean, a committee is created at the University, which includes representatives of the department, where the controversial issues as to the assessment of student knowledge arose, the dean of the faculty, the representatives of the student government of the faculty and of the student trade union organization. The committee considers the materials as to the student’s academic performance in the discipline and, if necessary, carries out additional assessment control.

The schedule for the assessment at all the stages of the study is presented in the educational program (EP) that is developed and approved as prescribed (Regulations on the introduction of educational programs in KhNMU). Each department informs students about the types of control and discipline assessment system at the beginning of the academic year. The information is posted at the department official webpage on the University website, in the distance learning system MOODLE; it is brought to notice to the stream and group monitors, to the student government bodies and deans of the respective faculties.

Conditions have been created at KhNMU to teach the training staff various methods of assessment of the activities of students’ performance in the framework of continuous training and at the refresher course both at the University and outside. During the period reported in the self-assessment report, 137 teachers underwent thematic advanced training (in the amount of 40 to 80 academic hours).

The University holds seminars and trainings with the participation of foreign experts. Based on bilateral university agreements for the period of 2016-2020, KhNMU hosted “Round Tables” with more than 100 well-known foreign specialists from the Czech Republic, Estonia, Lithuania, Germany, Belgium, France, Israel, the USA and other countries. Exchange of experience and suggestions to improve the methods of assessment are discussed at the educational and methodological conferences with international participation, which are held in Ukraine and, in particular, at the annual educational and methodological conference at the University, as well as at the meetings of the Central methodological board and specialized methodological committees of the University.

The decisions made, are introduced into the process of teaching disciplines and contribute to the improvement of teaching and students’ academic performance.

The results of student performance are taken into account when deciding on the award of scholarships, as well as in the competitive selection of students in case of provision of the academic mobility.

***Analytical section***

Assessment of students' academic performance is carried out at the following levels of intra-university monitoring: self-control, department monitoring, independent Rector test. The assessment covers knowledge and skills. As a whole, the assessment methods are comparable to the learning methods of teaching, training and learning outcomes. Students’ learning outcomes meet the requirements, which is proved by the employers’ opinion and the demand.

To improve the relationship between assessment and training, the University should pay attention to the methods based on the assessment of clinical competence (OSCE or Mini-Clinical Evaluation Exercise), which guarantee the assessment of attitudes towards learning and professional values. When monitoring and revising the EP, it is recommended to include “assessment usefulness”, which includes the combination of validity, reliability, impact on the training, the acceptability and effectiveness of the assessment methods and the format of marking, taking into account the peculiarities of professional/ clinical training.

***Strengths/Best Practice***

The strengths of the “Student Assessment” standard include:

* availability of the automated management system to monitor the students’ attendance and academic performance;

- availability of internal instructions that regulate conflict of interests’ prevention,

ensuring the transparency of the assessment, and that regulate the results evaluation appeal.

***EEP recommendations***

1. To develop the assessment of the clinical competencies of students (mini-CEX, OSCE), etc.

2. To pay attention to the reliability and validity of student assessment methods in the process of ensuring the quality of training.

***EEP conclusions on the grounds of the criteria: (strong/ satisfactory/ expect***

***improvement / unsatisfactory)***

strong - 0

satisfactory - 15

suggest improvements - 0

unsatisfactory - 0.

***6.4. Standard STUDENTS***

***Evidentiary section***

The implementation of the educational activity is carried out at KhNMU in accordance with the laws in force, the Law of Ukraine “On Higher Education” as of July 7, 2014, No. 1556-VII, Conditions for admission to higher education in 2020, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine dated October 11, 2019, N0. 1285 and registered in the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine as of October 2, 2019, No. 1192/34163, Rules for admission to study at KhNMU in 2020, approved by the Order of KhNMU on December 19, 2019 No. 510 on the basis of the decision of KhNMU Academic Council as of December 19, 2019, Protocol No. 11, Regulations on the KhNMU Admission Committee for 2020, approved by the Order of KhNMU dated December 19, 2019 No. 509 on the basis of the decision of KhNMU Academic Council dated December 19, 2019, Protocol No. 11.

The rules for admission to study at KhNMU are annually developed by the Admission Committee, in accordance with the Terms of Admission, approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine.

Admission to study in specialties is carried out in accordance with the List of subject area and specialties, according to which the training of the degree-seeking students is carried out. It is approved by the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine dated April 4, 2015, No.266.

Admission to KhNMU to obtain all the academic degrees is carried out on a competitive basis, regardless of the source of finance.

Admission to study at the expense of the state budget is carried out in accordance with the state order approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. The admission bulk for unbudgeted competitive offers is determined by the University within the licensed amount.

The applicants are provided with recommendations for admission to KhNMU to study at the expense of the state budget, which is based on the competitive score to obtain bachelor’s and master’s degrees on the basis of CGSE. It is carried out within a single competition for all the state customers.

The maximum admission bulk of the state order for KhNMU is formed taking into account the maximum bulk of the public contracts of all the competitive offers within the limits of specialties for the previous year.

KhNMU provides a system of academic counseling for students, which focuses on social, professional and financial support.

In order to support and advise the students, to facilitate integration into the university education, and with the aim of orientation in the choice of educational, cultural and social programs, the University has created and is implementing a mentoring program for the first-year students. Along with the teaching staff and SO “Student government of KhNMU”, the primary trade union organization of students, graduate students and clinical residents of KhNMU are also involved in the program.

The University is implementing the Anti-Corruption Program (order of KhNMU No. 300 as of September13, 2016). All the educational activity during the work with the students and information activity among the university staff are aimed at the formation of a high intolerance to the cases of corruption, therefore, at the University an Internet platform has been created to study the public opinion about the University, individual staff members. For this KhNMU e-mail box ([meduniver@knmu.kharko.ua](mailto:meduniver@knmu.kharko.ua)) has been created and there is mail of the University Rector (rector@knmu.kharkov.ua) where the information about negative facts in the activity of the University, dean’s offices, departments’ staff can be sent. There is also a telephone line +38 (057) 700-41-32 for citizens and requests for public information. Particular attention is focused on the work of the research sociological group UNIKO KhNMU that carries out the anonymous survey “The student’s impression of the university professor” and other sociological surveys, the results of which are widely publicized with the aim of prevention of misfeasance in office and bribery.

To provide material support and in order to encourage students, scholarships are provided. In accordance with the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 882 as of July12, 2004 and on the basis of the Regulations on scholarships for students, clinical residents, postgraduates and doctoral students of KhNMU (Order of KhNMU No. 440, dated December 29, 2017), the students receive scholarships in the prescribed manner, i.e., according to the results of the semester assessment (in the range from 40 to 45%) of the actual contingent –1300 UAH. Students with excellent academic performance and who actively participated in social life of the University, can receive an increased scholarship – 1892 UAH. Nominal scholarships of the President of Ukraine, the CMU, the Supreme Council Ukraine, KhRSA and city council are assigned for the students of special merits in studies and research. As of October 1, 2020, the academic scholarships were awarded to 1231 people, who study at the University. Individuals of the preferential contingent (orphans, victims of the Chernobyl nuclear power plant, children of miners, I-III groups disabled individuals, recognized victims of armed hostilities and the Revolution of Dignity, children from low-income families) were assigned the scholarships in the amount of 1180-2360 UAH on the basis of the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 1045 dated December 28, 2016. As of October 1, 2020, 243 students receive such scholarship. If funding is available, the University authorities financially reward the students, which encourages students to improve their academic performance and research.

Detection of the students, who need psychological, social, material and academic support starts at the Admission committee and is carried out throughout the entire period of study by the dean of the faculty, the vice dean for the educational work, curators and public organizations: SO “Student government of KhNMU”, primary trade union organization of students, graduate students and clinical residents of KhNMU.

The University guarantees and maintains confidentiality regarding counseling and support. Information about student assistance and counseling programs is brought to their attention on the University website, on Facebook, Instagram, on the websites of the SO "Student Government of KhNMU", the primary trade union organization of students, postgraduates and clinical residents of KhNMU. All the representatives of the teaching staff, employees of all structural subdivisions of the University observe complete confidentiality with respect to the data provided by the students and, in accordance with the current legislation of Ukraine, ensure the protection of personal data within the framework of their professional activities.

***Analytical section***

The processes implemented at the University meet the criteria of the standard. The University carries out its activities aimed at increasing the student potential. The results of the student survey demonstrate satisfaction with the dealings with the dean’s office (91.4%), the level of availability of the dean’s office (93.3%), the level of availability and responsiveness of the University authorities (80%), information support (90%).

***Strengths/Best Practice***

The availability of internal regulations that determine the procedure for the organization of the educational process, opportunity for the implementation of trust, justice, respect and responsibility. The University academic policy and practice have a clear message that data falsification, lying, dishonesty, fraud, obtaining property by false pretenses and other forms of dishonest behavior are unacceptable.

***EEP recommendations***

For effective clinical training and to achieve the planned learning outcomes it is necessary to co-ordinate the contingent of students, including the international students with the capabilities of the clinical sites and sites for practice.

***EEP conclusions by the criteria: (strong/satisfactory/expect improvements unsatisfactory)***

strong - 0

satisfactory - 16

expect improvement - 0

unsatisfactory - 0.

***6.5. Standard ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY***

***Evidentiary section***

The staff policy is carried out in accordance with the Constitution of Ukraine, the laws of Ukraine: “On collective agreements and contracts”, “On labor protection”, “On salaries”, “On vacations”, “On higher education”, the University Charter.

Recruitment of teaching, scientific and academic staff is carried out in accordance with the Code of Labor Laws, Laws of Ukraine “On education”, ”On higher education”, “On scientific and scientific and technical Activities”, “Regulations on the national institution” and “The procedure for replacing vacant positions of scientific and pedagogical workers of Kharkiv National Medical University”.

Admission to the positions of research-teaching, research and teaching staff is carried out under a contract or fixed-term employment contract. Accounting period for research-teaching, research and teaching staff is an academic year, for research staff is a calendar year.

The procedure for the formation of the staff schedule is approved by the order of KhNMU No. 271 dated 28.08.17 “On approval of the procedure for the formation, approval and amendment of the staff schedule of KhNMU”. The competition for filling positions is announced by the rector, by issuing an order. Further, the announcement of the competition is published on the official website of the University, namely <http://www.knmu.kharkov.ua>. Applications and documents for participation in the competition are submitted to the HR department within one month from the date of a competition announcement publication. After the deadline for submission of applications the commission, within 10 days, considers the applicants, and makes a decision (in written form for each candidate) on their compliance with the requirements of legislation and conditions of the competition. The Scientific Council elects by secret ballot with taking into account the proposals of the staff of the faculty (institute, college) and the department for vacant positions of heads and professors of departments, directors (heads) of educational and scientific (research) institutes (centers), library and Medical College, deans of the faculty. The minutes of the counting commission are approved by a majority of votes.

The regulation of teaching activities is carried out in accordance with Article 56 of the Law of Ukraine “On higher education”, as well as in accordance with the provision “On the norms of time for planning and accounting of educational and other work of research and teaching staff of KhNMU”, approved by the order of KhNMU No. 139 dated 01.04.2015.

Research and teaching staff at their main place of work in higher educational institutions carry out educational, methodological, scientific and organizational activities. The working time of the teaching staff is 36 hours a week, 1548 hours a year. The working hours of the teaching staff whose activities are associated with harmful working conditions (established by the relevant regulatory legal act) is 30 hours per week, 1290 hours per year.

Normative data on working hours are contained in the “Collective agreement between the administration and the trade union committee of KhNMU for 2020-2025”, which was approved at the staff conference on 23.12.2019, minutes No. 1.

The work of the teaching staff stimulated in accordance with the Law of Ukraine “On remuneration”, “On approval of the procedure for calculating the average salary”, “Regulations on the national establishment (institution) of Ukraine”, the Charter of Kharkiv National Medical University and other regulatory legal acts, in order to stimulate labor of employees of the institution, increasing their compliance for the performance of tasks assigned to the staff.

***Analytical section***

The university has standard procedures for admission and selection of teaching staff. The teaching staff is involved in the implementation of scientific research. The results of scientific developments are included in the educational process. The teaching staff has close ties with representatives of practical health care.

The results of the questionnaire survey of the teaching staff indicate a high level of satisfaction with the attitude of management (83.5%), relations with colleagues at the department (95.6%), relations with students (84.6%), participation in managerial decision-making (85.7%) , recognition of successes and achievements on the part of the administration (96.9%), the activities of the administration (90.1%), working conditions (85.7%), organization and quality of food (91.2%) and medical care (84.6% ). 67% are satisfied with the provision of a social package: rest, sanatorium treatment, etc., 54.9% are satisfied with the terms of payment, 80% of teachers are satisfied with the possibilities of continuous potential development.

***Strengths/best practices***

* Availability of normative documents regulating the staffing of the educational process.
* The system of motivation of teaching staff and the provided opportunities for continuous professional development.
* KhNMU, with the help of its teaching staff, perfectly provides high-quality educational and scientific services for the training of qualified healthcare professionals
* University staff are guaranteed to have the right to elect colleagues and be elected to all bodies in accordance with the applicable criteria.
* Each employee of the University has the necessary conditions for work and performance of official duties. Procedures for organizing and running competitions are based on transparency, objectivity and merit-based selection.

***EEP recommendations***

To ensure regular professional development of teaching staff, including clinical mentors, through introduction of methods of clinical training and assessment of clinical competencies.

***EEP conclusions on the grounds of criteria (strong/ satisfactory/ expect improvement/ unsatisfactory)***

strong - 1

satisfactory - 11

expect improvement - 0

unsatisfactory - 0.

***6.6. Standard EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES***

***Evidentiary section***

Kharkiv National Medical University is a modern multidisciplinary educational institution with a powerful scientific and material-technical base.

The educational process is carried out at 71 departments, which are included in the faculties and the institute. The departments of the fundamental and social and humanitarian profile are located in 9 educational buildings, the total area of ​​which is 61,106.4 m2. Namely: the main educational building – 15,618.9 m2; building “A” – 5028 m2; building “B” – 4400 m2; educational and laboratory building – 10,031.5 m2; Department of Anatomy building – 3,165 m2; Department of Military Medicine building (12 Trinklera Street) – 2,972.0 m2; Department of Epidemiology building (12 Trinklera Street) – 3,195 м2; Research Institute of Occupational Hygiene and Occupational Diseases (12 Trinklera Street) – 10,205.5 m2.

48 clinical departments of the university are located on 121 clinical sites in 79 health care institutions of various forms of ownership and level of subordination, as well as on the basis of 3 scientific and practical medical centers of the university. Some clinical departments are located in university hospitals. Thus, the departments of the dental profile are located in the building of the University Dental Center of KhNMU (51 Pobedy Avenue, total area – 6,490.3 m2). Separate clinical departments (Neurology No. 2; Urology, Nephrology, Andrology; General Practice and Family Medicine, etc.) operate on the basis of the Educational and Scientific Medical Center “University Hospital” (4 Tekstilnaya Street; total area – 13,910.5 m2).

Medical professional college of KhNMU is located in a separate building (11 Ihoria Muranova Street; total area – 2,416.1 m2).

The bases of scientific institutes of the university are involved in the educational process: Research Institute of Occupational Hygiene and Occupational Diseases of KhNMU (the institute includes a clinic for occupational diseases), Educational and Scientific Institute for the Quality of Education of KhNMU.

The structure of the Educational and Scientific Institute for the Quality of Education of KhNMU includes four computer classes of different levels of preparation for control events, rector's control, etc.; interdepartmental simulation classes for the profiles “Pediatrics”, “Surgery”, “Obstetrics and Gynecology”, “Medicine of Emergency Conditions” and “Therapy”, which are equipped with modern simulators and models, including high-tech ones. In the classrooms, classes are held for students from the 3rd to graduation year of all faculties.

The following university departments participate in the educational and scientific process: Central Research Laboratory; Ukrainian Institute of Clinical Genetics, KhNMU; 5 fundamental research laboratories; Scientific and Practical Center for Preclinical and Clinical Research, KhNMU; Center for Gender Education; Center for Medical Local Lore; vivarium.

The balance sheet of the university includes the Medic Sports and Health Camp with an area of ​​891.0 m2. The university owns 6 student hostels with a total area of ​​33,022.7 m2 (living area – 14,861.1 m2), the number of beds in hostels – 2,076, an interuniversity family hostel with an area of 1,176.5 m2 (living area – 550 m2), as well as living quarters at 57 Plekhanovskaya Street with an area of 683.5 m2 and at 2 23 Avgusta Street with an area of 187.5 m2.

The departments and educational units of the university are provided with computer equipment and access to the Internet: 27 computer classes with a total of more than 430 workplaces. The local Internet connection network with a capacity of 100 Mb unites about 800 stationary computers and has the ability to provide up to 800 Wi-Fi points of access. All 6 hostels of the university are connected to the Internet. External connections and most of the internal ones are made on optical means.

The information component of the educational process is provided by the Scientific Library of the University, which is located in two buildings, building “B” and building “ULK”, occupying a total area of ​​2,824.5 m2.

The library's local network unites 205 computers, 2 servers, 11 multimedia complexes for teaching and holding scientific and cultural events, copying equipment, including 3 contactless scanners for digitizing rare and valuable publications, a mobile interactive video panel, duplicating and copying equipment, scanners for automated issuance of documents.

Clinical and practical training of students, as well as medical and diagnostic work of research and teaching staff of 48 clinical departments of the university is carried out in 79 medical institutions, of which: 48 healthcare institutions of the city and region, 7 institutes of the National Academy of Medical Sciences of Ukraine, 3 departmental healthcare institutions and 21 private medical clinics, as well as on the basis of 3 scientific and practical medical centers of the university: Scientific and Educational Medical Center “University Clinic” of KhNMU, University Dental Center of KhNMU, Clinic of the Research Institute of Occupational Hygiene and Occupational Diseases of KhNMU.

***Analytical section***

The analytical part is formed based on the analysis of the compliance of the evidentiary section with the criteria of the Standard. It describes possible causes or provides an explanation for whether the EC and/or EP meets the criteria of the Standard.

The results of the questioning of the teaching staff indicate a high level of satisfaction in providing classrooms (84.6%), conditions for classes in classrooms (89%), technical equipment of classrooms (93.4%), timely receipt of information (87-95.6%), balanced teaching load (82.4%), availability of educational literature (82.4%). Concern about a large number of students in groups is expressed by 31.9% of the teaching staff, about an inconvenient schedule by 26.4%, and about 65.9% by students who have no interest in learning. When polling students, 87% believe that the library is well equipped, 84.8% are satisfied with the computer classes.

***Strengths/best practice***

* Availability of own clinical sites and striving to expand it.
* Accreditation of a number of EPs by the National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education.
* Availability of educational and research and production associations created on the basis of one-profile departments and scientific research academic institutes.
* Stable and consistent expansion of the educational process management information system at the University.
* Expansion of international relations for the implementation of academic mobility of students and teachers

***EEP recommendations***

1. To strengthen efforts to provide a safe environment for staff, students and patients, including expanding student access to simulation equipment for individual improvement of practical skills.
2. It is recommended to provide for the final learning outcomes of the knowledge of the principles of scientific methodology in order to form analytical and critical thinking
3. In the process of effective clinical training, in order to meet the needs of practical health care and the population served, it is necessary to clearly coordinate the admission of students with clinical and practice bases.
4. To continue to improve the expertise that studies the processes, practices and problems of medical education with the involvement of independent experts.

***EEP conclusions on the grounds of the criteria (strong/ satisfactory/ expect improvement/ unsatisfactory)***

strong - 0

satisfactory - 27

expect improvement - 3

unsatisfactory - 0.

***6.7. Standard PROGRAM EVALUATION.***

***Evidentiary Section***

In order to regulate the process of creating and approving new EP, as well as for implementation, monitoring and periodic revision of the existing EP, organization of internal quality assurance system, the university has developed and approved “Regulations on the Educational Programs Implementation in KhNMU” (the order of KhNMU dated August 27, 2019 No.305).

In accordance with the Law of Ukraine “On Higher Education”, the quality assurance system of higher education in Ukraine consists of the system of internal assurance of the quality of higher education institutions; external quality assurance system of educational activities in higher education institutions and the quality of higher education; quality assurance system of the National Agency for quality assurance in higher education and independent institutions for assessment and provision of the quality of higher education.

In academic year 2019-2020, the National Agency for quality assurance in higher education carried out accreditation (as an external assessment quality) of 4 educational programs of educational qualification levels “Bachelor” and “Master”, according to which the students are trained. The recommendations of the boards were taken into account and measures to improve programs and eliminate shortcomings were developed.

The university has a system of internal quality assurance in education provided by the “Regulation on the quality assurance system of educational activities at KhNMU”, approved by the order of KhNMU dated 04.16.2018, No. 118. The university created a division, the main objective of which is to improve and develop the quality assurance system for educational activities in the university ­– ERIEQ. Its activities are governed by the ERIEQ Regulations approved by the order of KhNMU dated January 30, 2017 No. 300.

By results of an independent external audit conducted by Ukrainian authority for certification of quality management systems “Rosukrsert” in 2018, KhNMU received certificate of compliance of the quality management system with the requirements of ISO 9001: 2015 (ISO 9001: 2015, IDT).

The rights and obligations of all participants of the educational process, publicity, transparency, openness and accessibility for participants in the educational process are governed by the official documents of KhNMU: Charter of Kharkiv National Medical University, Concept of Kharkiv National Medical University Development for 2015-2025, Collective Agreement for 2020-2025, Comprehensive University Plan; Regulations of Educational Process Organization in KhNMU, Regulation on the Introduction of Educational Programs in KhNMU, Regulations on the Procedure and Conditions for Choosing Elective Courses by KhNMU Students, Instruction on the Assessment of Educational Activities into the European Credit Transfer System of the Organization of the Educational Process at KhNMU, Regulation on Prevention, Anticipation and Settling of Cases related to sexual harassment and discrimination in KhNMU, Code of Academic Integrity and others.

Administration of EP “Medicine” is conducted by the deans, Academic Boards of medical faculties, the Academic Board of ERIPT, the Academic Board of ERITIC, Central Methodological Commission of KhNMU, Academic Board of the University.

The project group and the project manager – the guarantor of the EP are involved in the development of the EP. Composition of the group and the guarantor are approved by order of the rector.

The new EP is developed at the initiative of the University management, faculty, ERIPT, ERITIC and the initiative group from among the research and teaching staff (RTS).

EP assessment procedures include assessment of its content and main components, structure of the educational program, the ratio of mandatory and optional parts.

Basic requirements for the duration of EP at a specific level of education and the structure of compulsory and elective disciplines (75% and 25%, respectively) are determined by the legislation of Ukraine. When developing an EP by a project group specific components and features of their study are determined to achieve relevant learning outcomes.

Rector’s control (measurements) is carried out annually through the revealing of theoretical level of knowledge and practical skills assimilation levels.

The University takes into account and implements the comments and recommendations of the National Agency for quality assurance in higher education, received after the EP accreditation procedure (external quality control of education). When accrediting EP, criteria developed by taking into account standards and recommendations of the quality assurance of the European Area of Higher Education are used.

The EP project group monitors the implementation of the program and develops an action plan to eliminate the identified shortcomings. The university fulfills analysis of the results of external independent testing of medical faculties students – exam “KROK”, as well as rector’s controls – internal control of students’ knowledge level and readiness for this exam. According to the analysis of the results, administrative, organizational and methodological decisions to improve the quality of training, comprehensively assess and improve the quality of educational process are taken. Based on the results of the final exams, a report of the head of Examination Board is drawn up, with his/her recommendations and conclusions on improving the quality of students’ knowledge, their [acquisition](https://www.multitran.com/m.exe?s=acquisition&l1=1&l2=2) of the final learning outcomes. These recommendations and comments are analyzed at the Academic Boards of faculties and of the university and an appropriate action plan for their elimination is developed and implemented.

Based on the program competencies and program learning outcomes the project team determines the total time budget; amount of ECTS credits, necessary to achieve the stated results; carries out structuring learning outcomes (academic disciplines) and distributes ECTS credits and can revise this distribution if necessary, but not less than once every 2 years.

Student self-government bodies can make suggestions and comments regarding the EP content.

One of the strategic objectives of the university, defined in the Concept of KhNMU Development for 2015-2020 (edition of the 2020), is development of an active public positions and participation in the development and implementation of programs and activities in the field of social life improvement, in particular in health care aspects, public health enhancement at the local, regional and state levels. The management, teaching staff and students are involved in the implementation of this strategic objective.

Since 2006, ERIEQ has conducted 34 sociological surveys of the key participants in the educational process – students and teachers, on the following topics: “Distance education in KhNMU” (in 2020, 23 students and teachers were interviewed separately, the survey was conducted together with the Students Council of KhNMU), “Student and his/her health” (2019), “Assessment of the teacher's work in practical classes” (2019), “Education in KhNMU and the labor market” (2018), “Internship assessed by the students community” (2017-2018), “Students on plagiarism and peculiarities of lectures” (2017). Research results were discussed at meetings of Academic Board of the university and of separate faculties, they were published on the website of the educational institutions. Based on the research results, the algorithms for organizing distance learning, the needs of teachers and students in access to electronic resources and databases were taken into account, management decisions on improving activities of the departments of the university, in particular, those working with foreign students were made.

At the same time, the study of feedback by organizing local anonymous surveys at all faculties and courses (during the academic year and in the end of semesters with subsequent discussions of the results at meetings of student self-governance bodies), as well as collecting immediate information from the “box trust” is carried out by the Students Council. Based on the data received, the Students Council periodically gives suggestions to the university administration on improving the educational process.

Since 2019 ERIEQ has been conducting special sociological “measurements” within the framework of individual specialties, where each applicant for education gives his/her assessment of the educational process [anonymously](https://www.multitran.com/m.exe?s=anonymously&l1=1&l2=2) twice (directly during training and upon completion). By September 2020, 11 local studies were conducted. Besides the administration of the university, guarantors of educational programs, as well as teachers of departments working with a specific specialty [necessarily](https://www.multitran.com/m.exe?s=necessarily&l1=1&l2=2) [become acquainted with](https://www.multitran.com/m.exe?s=become+acquainted+with&l1=1&l2=2) their results.

Students’ survey results are used by the EP guarantors and the management board of the university for improving the EP and making appropriate management decisions. Heads of departments and RTS use them to improve the forms and methods of teaching, quality of teaching and learning of individual components of the EP.

Monitoring of student academic performance is one of the criteria for educational quality assessment. The university conducts such monitoring depending on semester of study, academic year, academic discipline, duration of study, method of checking and assessing knowledge, the number of re-examinations, the frequency of academic discipline repetition, medium of teaching etc.

[Peculiarity](https://www.multitran.com/m.exe?s=peculiarity&l1=1&l2=2) of study in medical HEI, the complexity of the educational program and high requirements for students result in the fact that on average 2–3% of students (especially in the first years of their studies) are annually expelled from the university. The reasons for this are mainly academic failure, failed exam “KROK-1” in the third year and much less often, illness, failure to return from academic leave, or other personal motives. Measures to reduce the dropout rates include: direct all-round assistance from the students self-governance, group and individual consultations with teachers, individual conversations between students and head of the department/dean, retraining, consultation with university psychologists, a set of motivating events, for example, an annual awarding the best students for academic success, research and sports achievements, for social activity, organization of internships abroad, etc.

The University has provided documents proving sufficient material and technical support of the implemented EP.

To improve the EP and overall university learning outcomes the interests and requirements of employers are taken into account. The University holds the “Fair of vacancies” for students and graduates, which gives them opportunity to communicate personally with representatives of medical institutions and local government and, possibly, decide on a place of work. 17 medical institutions of Kharkiv region provide their vacancies to guests. The “Fair of vacancies” is part of the project “Effective primary care in society”, which is implemented and funded as a part of European Union program “Support of civil society, local authorities and human rights”.

Graduate placement of state-financed students is mostly carried out through inquiries from health departments. Graduates employment promotion sector coordinates the actions of students in their future employment, conducts analysis of supply and demand in the labor market of medical workers. Generally the university receives positive feedback on the quality of preparation of EP graduates, which is confirmed by employers’ interviews.

Continuous feedback through round tables, interviews, participations in meetings of the Academic Council is maintained with EP graduates who are potential employers.

***Analytical Section***

Self-assessment report according to the standard “Program Evaluation” is confirmed by the results of the focus group interviews and meets the criteria of the standard and demonstrates the existence of a monitoring and evaluation system for the EP based on feedback from stakeholders, analysis of student learning achievements.

The results of the survey indicate that 78% estimate the level of feedback between RTS and the university management as high, 77% of students note quick response to [two-way communication](https://www.multitran.com/m.exe?s=two-way+communication&l1=1&l2=2) from teachers.

At the same time, the university should pay attention to attracting students to internal quality assurance processes through participation in focus groups, preparation of self-assessment reports of the university, working in the bodies responsible for the processes of internal quality assurance, monitoring and revision of the EP. During the [expert examination](https://www.multitran.com/m.exe?s=carrying+out+expert+examination&l1=1&l2=2) of the EP students and other parties concerned should be involved in discussion of learning outcomes. The academic staff responsible for the implementation of the program and its components, must ensure consistency and relationship between the results of program learning, learning, teaching and assessment procedures (structural alignment Biggs, 2003). Revised learning outcomes should be validated and assessed in order to connect them with relevant learning activities, methods and evaluation criteria.

***Strengths/Best Practice***

The multi-level system of educational quality assurance from specifically created division – ERIEQ, quality management system in the university meeting the requirements of the ISO 9001: 2015 standard, many years of practice in sociological research to independent test control in the form of licensed integrated test exams (“KROK 1” and “KROK 2”) should be attributed to the strengths according to the standard “Program Evaluation”.

***EEP Recommendations***

The study of practice processes and problems of medical education, with the involvement of specialists with experience in conducting research in medical education, psychologists and sociologists in the field of education with the regulation of criteria and indicators of evidential base in internal/external assessment should be included into the EP evaluation policy.

***EEP conclusions*** ***on the grounds of the criteria: (strong /satisfactory/ expect improvement/ unsatisfactory)***

strong – 1

satisfactory – 23

suggest improvement – 0

unsatisfactory – 0.

***6.8. Standard «MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION»***

**Evidentiary section**

In accordance with the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education" (No. 1556-VII dated 01.07.2014), KhNMU is self-governed and is financially autonomic. The rights and obligations of the officials are established by internal procedures and specified instructions developed and approved in the established order. The powers, tasks and responsibilities of the structural divisions correspond to the areas of their activities, and are fixed by the Regulation on structural unit. The staff is guided by internal regulations, orders of the rector, decisions of the governing body of KhNMU, instructions of vice-rectors of relevant areas, procedures for managing the quality of education, as well as instructions and orders of the heads of structural divisions. Heads of KhNMU and its structural divisions have the administrative responsibility for decisions taken and the results of their implementation. Relationships among participants of the educational process are regulated by the Rules of KhNMU Internal Regulations, The Code of Corporate Ethics, Regulations on holding competition in filling vacant positions of the head and other internal documents of the university.

In general, the MESU and its structural divisions of the regional and local level deal with the formation and implementation of state policy in the educational field. Given the sector affiliation of KhNMU, this process also involves the MHU, which approves the composition of the Supervisory Board of KhNMU; approves the charter of KhNMU; announces a competition, appoints and dismisses the rector, concludes a contract with him, controls his activities and holds him to account; monitors compliance with the standards of higher medical education, and financial and economic activities; agrees appointment and dismissal of the vice-rector for scientific and pedagogical activities, the main accountant and head of the legal department at the request of the rector; carries out internal audit activities of KhNMU and other functions.

The Supervisory Board has a term of office for 3 years. Its composition is formed from persons who are not employees of KhNMU, and the composition of the council is approved by the MHU.

The direct administration of KhNMU is carried out by officials, their list and functions are regulated by the existing regulatory framework and fixed by the Charter of KhNMU, the distribution of functional responsibilities between the rector and pro-rectors for academic work, pro-rector for research and pro-rector for administrative and economic work (order of KhNMU dated October 17, 2019 No. 421), job descriptions of KhNMU managers and its structural divisions. Selected issues of the strategic and operational management of KhNMU development are the competence of the Conference labor collective of KhNMU, Academic Board of KhNMU, as well as councils of faculties and structural divisions.

Involvement of students in the management of the vital activity of KhNMU is provided by the representation within the established quotas in the Academic Board and councils of faculties (education and research institute) of KhNMU.

The transparency of the management system is ensured through the implementation of the set of measures: placement of draft documents (strategies, programs, decisions) on the website of KhNMU and their further public discussion; publication of plans and reports; placement of the information about the EP, including the admission quota and the cost of education; conduction and discussion of the results of sociological surveys.

The analysis of the constituent documents of KhNMU, local regulatory documents, the results of the EEP meetings with the university management and focus groups allowed establishing that the management structure and functions of structural divisions were determined in KhNMU. The responsibility of the heads of structural divisions for the development and management of educational programs was developed, responsibilities and authorities, including the provision of the necessary resources, including target budget for education were divided and assigned. There is an appropriate guidance and administrative staff for the implementation of educational programs and implementation other activities to ensure the proper level of management and allocation of resources.

The management system is effectively functioning in KhNMU: administrative management divisions, Dean’s offices, departments and other structural divisions. Both vertical and horizontal communications are regulated. Participation of all subdivisions in the processes and procedures of the internal quality assurance system is ensured. On the official website of KhNMU and in the media, the complete and reliable information about achievements, as well as objective data on the employment and demand of graduates is published.

The activities of all structural divisions of the university are transparent. Electronic versions of activities (plans, reports) of structural units are available to all interested parties.

KhNMU pays due attention to the academic management, responsible approach to the development and management of the educational program. Periodically the assessment of the academic management concerning achievement of its mission and final learning outcomes is conducted.

KhNMU has the necessary clear terms of responsibilities and authority for providing the educational program with resources, including the target budget for education. The financing system of KhNMU is based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency and responsibility at all budget levels.

***Analytical section***

The achievements in the field of medicine and public health are taken into account in the allocation of resources. In KhNMU the management quality system has been developed and implemented, it includes consideration of needs for improvement, conducts the regular review and management analysis.

***Strengths/ best practice***

* KhNMU has sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including the possibility of remuneration of the AS depending on the achievement of the results of education.
* The academic management structure ensures an appropriate level of education quality and the effectiveness of using the available resource potential.
* The management system transparency increases the confidence of the staff to the management of KhNMU and its structural divisions.
* Consistently high incomes of KhNMU from its activities and their rational using.
* Continuous improvement of the management quality in accordance with the requirements ISO9001: 2015 standard.
* Availability of agreements on long-term and mutually beneficial cooperation with healthcare organizations.

***EEP Recommendations***

With a view of further attracting of foreign applicants and improving their awareness, the work on updating and filling the English-language version of the university website should be continued.

***EEP conclusions on the grounds of the criteria: (strong/ satisfactory/ expect improvement / unsatisfactory)***

strong – 2

satisfactory – 15

expect improvement - 0

unsatisfactory – 0.

***6.9. Standard «CONTINUOUS UPDATE»***

***Evidentiary section***

In 2015, the university developed and approved the Concept of Kharkiv National Medical University Development for 2015 - 2025". The concept was created taking into account the requirements of regulatory documents of specialized departments - MESU and MHU (the Law of Ukraine "On Higher Education", strategy of reforming of higher education in Ukraine until 2020, National strategy for building a new healthcare system in Ukraine for the period 2015-2025, etc.). The concept is reviewed regularly depending on regulatory framework changes or university needs, and is supplemented (the last revision and additions were discussed and approved at the meeting of the Academic Board of the University on August 31, 2020, record No. 7).

In order to improve the system of providing educational services and improving the quality of education, in 2015, the university passed the certification procedure and received a certificate for compliance with the education quality management system international standard ISO 9001: 2008. Compliance with the standard guarantees the quality of the university processes and ensures a high level of trust in its opportunities as a high-level educational structure. Every year a procedure of annual confirmatory audit was held. In 2018, after the independent external audit the compliance of the quality management system of the university to the requirements of the state standard ISO 9001: 2015 was proved. A certificate of compliance of the quality management system with ISO requirements 9001: 2015 (ISO 9001: 2015, IDT) was received.

The quality of the university's work assured at all structural levels from the institute and faculty to departments and laboratories. Heads of structural departments at their levels evaluate the work and carry out planning activities for the following period. Based on their proposals, the Comprehensive university work plan for the academic year is formed including the main vectors and directions in the development of the university. The comprehensive plan is discussed in structural divisions and is adopted at the meeting of the supreme self-government body of the university - Meeting of the employees at the beginning of the academic year. The plan is adopted after the rector's report on the results of the university's work in the past academic year, their analysis and discussion.

The documentation analysis, results of meetings of EEP members with the management of KhNMU, directors of institutes, deans of faculties, heads of departments, representatives of the professional community, employers allowed to establish that the university has initiated and carried out the procedures for assessment and review of the structure, content of educational programs, results/competencies, assessment methods and learning environment, elimination of identified deficiencies and highlighting of resources for constant programs updating. Procedures of the periodic external evaluation of educational programs have been initiated and carried out. The university updating process is based on prospective studies and performance analyzes of the previous experience with a focus on scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of the society. The elements of the educational program are adjusted taking into account the advances in biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical sciences at the present stage of the socio-economic and cultural development of the society. In the educational process, due attention is paid to the development of assessment principles and achievement of the formed final learning outcomes. KhNMU refers responsibly to a student recruitment policy taking into account dynamic changes in demand for personnel. Much attention is paid to improving the monitoring process and evaluating the educational program aimed at the satisfaction of various groups of interested parties.

***Analytical section***

Within the framework of a well-functioning quality monitoring system at KhNMU, the education environment and the quality of the implemented program are assessed regularly; conditions for continuous improvement are created. Modern theories in education, teaching methodology and principles of active learning are taken into account. Updating of educational resources meets changing needs.

KhNMU is constantly working on improving the organizational structure and management principles to ensure effective performance under conditions of dynamic changes, both in the educational market and in the labor market.

***Strengths/best practice***

* KhNMU bases the renewal process on prospective researches and analysis of the results of own researches, taking into account the world practice.
* The quality management system of the University is certified at the national and international levels.
* The constant search and implementation of advanced educational methods in training.
* The transition to European educational standards in teaching, scientific work, management and control systems.
* The continuous innovative development of all stages and constituent parts of the educational process.

***EEP Recommendations***

In order to ensure the compliance of education and research with international standards, involvement of foreign experts in the assessment of educational programs should be envisaged.

***EEP conclusions on the criteria: (strong/ satisfactory/ expect improvement/ unsatisfactory)***

strong – 0

satisfactory – 14

expect improvement - 0

unsatisfactory – 0.

**(VII) REVIEW OF STRENGTHS/BEST PRACTICE FOR EACH STANDARD**

***6.1. Standard «MISSION AND OUTCOMES»***

✓Education quality assurance system.

✓Institutional freedom to develop educational programs with a choice of forms of organization of the educational process and teaching methods.

✓Sufficient material and technical, organizational, informational, methodological base that forms the potential for the implementation of the university's mission.

✓KhNMU assists the introduction of innovations in the process of learning, allowing the development of broader and more specialized competencies than those that are realized as based competencies.

***6.2. Standard «EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM»***

The potential of the teaching staff with a confirmed level of scientific and professional activity, approaches to the management of the program at all levels of the university - teams of departments, deans, boards of faculties, institutes, the central methodological panel, the Academic Board and strong ties of the university with practical healthcare.

***6.3. Standard «STUDENT ASSESSMENT»***

✓Presence of an automatic control system for recording attendance and students’ progress;

✓Availability of normative documents regulating the prevention of conflicts of interests, ensuring transparency of the assessment and regulating the appeal of the assessment results.

***6.4. Standard «STUDENTS»***

The presence of internal regulatory documents that determine the procedure for organizing the educational process, the preconditions for the implementation of trust, justice, respect and responsibility. The university's academic policies and practices have a clear message that data falsification, lying, deceiving, fraud, appropriation and other forms of dishonest behavior are unacceptable.

***6.5. Standard «ACADEMIC STAFF/ FACULTY»***

✓Availability of normative documents regulating the staffing of the educational process.

✓System of motivation of teaching staff and providing opportunities for continuous professional development.

✓KhNMU, with the help of its academic staff excellently provides high-quality educational and scientific services for training of qualified healthcare professionals.

✓University staff are guaranteed to have the right to elect colleagues and be elected to all bodies in accordance with applicable criteria.

✓ Each employee of the University has the necessary conditions for work and performance of official duties. And procedures for organizing and holding competitions are based on transparency, objectivity and merit-based selection.

***6.6. Standard «EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES»***

✓Availability of the own clinical site and ambition to expand it.

✓Accreditation of a number of the EPs by the National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education.

✓ Availability of educational, research and production associations created on the basis of one-profile departments and scientific research academic institutes.

✓Stable and consistent expansion of the educational process management information system at the University.

✓Expansion of international relations for the implementation of academic mobility of the students and teachers.

***6.7. Standard «PROGRAM EVALUATION»***

The strengths of standard "Program Evaluation" include a multi-level system of education quality assurance from a specially created unit - ERIEQ, a quality management system at the University that meets the requirements of ISO 9001: 2015, long-term practice of sociological research to independent test control in the form of licensed integrated test exams ("KROK-1" and "KROK-2»).

***6.8. Standard «MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION»***

✓KhNMU has sufficient autonomy in allocation of resources, including the ability to remunerate teaching staff depending on the achievement of the final learning outcomes.

✓ The structure of academic management ensures an appropriate level of quality of education and the effectiveness of using the available resource potential.

✓The transparency of the management system increases the confidence of the team in the management of KNMU and its structural divisions.

✓Stable high incomes of KhNMU from its activities and their rational use.

✓Constantly improving the quality of management, in accordance with the requirements of ISO 9001: 2015.

✓Presence of agreements on long-term and mutually beneficial cooperation with healthcare organizations.

***6.9. Standard «CONTINUOUS UPDATE»***

KhNMU bases the renewal process on prospective research and analysis of the results of its own research, taking into account world practice.

The quality management system of the University is certified at the state and international levels.

Constant search and implementation of advanced educational methods in education.

Transition to European educational standards in teaching, research activity, management and control system.

Continuous innovative development of all stages and component parts of the educational process.

**(VIII) REVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS ON QUALITY ASSURANCE FOR EACH STANDARD**

***6.1. Standard «MISSION AND OUTCOMES»***

1. When developing and revising EP, it is necessary to involve more employers in the definition and revision of the final learning outcomes for educational programs.

***6.2. Standard «EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM»***

1. In order to expand the accessibility of education for people with health disabilities, it is recommended to create favorable conditions: vocational guidance, adapted teaching methods and curriculum, relations between students, teachers and others with informing the population about the opportunities inclusive medical education.

2. In order to form analytical and critical thinking and reflect them in the final learning outcomes of the EP, provide for mastering the basics and principles of scientific methodology within the framework of compulsory and/ or elective components.

***6.3. Standard «STUDENT ASSESSMENT»***

1. Develop an assessment of the clinical competencies of students (mini-CEX, OSCE), etc.

2. In the process of ensuring the quality of training, pay attention to the reliability and validity of methods for assessing students.

***6.4. Standard «STUDENTS»***

For effective clinical training and achievement of planned learning outcomes, it is necessary to coordinate the contingent of students, including foreign students, with the capabilities of clinical sites and practice sites.

***6.5. STANDARD «ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY»***

To implement clinical teaching methods and assess clinical competencies to provide regular professional development of teaching staff, including clinical mentors.

***6.6. Standard «EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES»***

1. Strengthen the efforts to provide a safe environment for the staff, students and patients, including expanding student access to simulation equipment for self-development of practical skills.

2. It is recommended to provide for the final learning outcomes of the knowledge of the principles of scientific methodology in order to form analytical and critical thinking.

3. In the process of effective clinical training, in order to meet the needs of practical health care and the population served, it is necessary to clearly coordinate the admission of students with clinical sites and practice sites.

4. Continue to improve the expertise that studies the processes, practices and problems of medical education with the involvement of independent experts.

***6.7. Standard «EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM»***

In the policy of the EP expertise it is necessary to include the study of the processes of practice and problems of medical education, with the involvement of specialists with experience in conducting research in medical education, psychologists and sociologists in the field of education with the regulation of criteria and indicators of the evidence base of internal/ external expertise.

***6.8. Standard «MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION»***

In order to further attract foreign applicants and increase their awareness, continue to work on updating and filling the English version of the university’s website.

***6.9. Standard «CONTINUOUS UPDATE»***

In order to ensure the compliance of training and research with international standards, provide for the involvement of foreign experts in the assessment of educational programs.

**(IX) RECOMMENDATION TO ACCREDITATION BOARD**

**Appendix 1. INSTITUTIONAL PROFILE PARAMETERS**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **No.** | **No.** | **Criteria No.** | **ASSESSMENT CRITERIA** | **Position of institution of education** | | | |
| **Strong** | **Satisfactory** | **Expects improvements** | **Unsatisfactory** |
|  |  | **1.**  **1.1** | **"MISSION AND RESULTS"**  **Defining the mission statement** | | | |  |
| 1 | 1 | 1.1.1 | The medical institution of education **must** define its *mission* and mission of the academic program and communicate it to stakeholders and the healthcare  sector. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | The mission statement **must** contain goals and an  educational strategy to train a competent doctor at the level of basic medical education: |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 2 | 1.1.2 | with an appropriate basis for further career in any field of medicine, including all types of medical practice, administrative medicine and scientific research in  medicine. |  | + |  |  |
| 3 | 3 | 1.1.3 | able to fulfill the role and function of a doctor in  compliance with the healthcare sector requirements. |  | + |  |  |
| 4 | 4 | 1.1.4 | prepared for **postgraduate** education. |  | + |  |  |
| 5 | 5 | 1.1.5 | with a commitment to lifelong learning, including professional responsibility to support the level of knowledge and skills through performance assessment, auditing, learning from own practice and recognized  activities in the *CPD / CME*. |  | + |  |  |
| 6 | 6 | 1.1.6 | Medical institution of education **should** ensure that the stated mission covers advances in medical research in the biomedical, clinical, behavioral and social sciences. | + |  |  |  |
| 7 | 7 | 1.1.7 | Medical institution of education **should** ensure that the stated mission covers aspects of global health and reflects major international health issues. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 1.2 | **Participation in defining the mission statement** |  |  |  |  |
| 8 | 8 | 1.2.1 | Medical institution of education **must** ensure that the *main stakeholders* are involved in defining the mission statement. |  | + |  |  |
| 9 | 9 | 1.2.2 | Medical institution of education **should** ensure that the stated mission is based on the opinions/  suggestions of *other relevant stakeholders*. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 1.3 | **Institutional autonomy and academic freedom** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must** have *institutional autonomy* for the development and implementation of a policy for which the administration and teaching staff are responsible for in relation to the following: |  |  |  |  |
| 10 | 10 | 1.3.1 | development and elaboration of the educational program; |  | + |  |  |
| 11 | 11 | 1.3.2 | use of allocated resources required for the implementation of the educational program. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical educational organization **should** guarantee *academic freedom* to its employees and students: |  |  |  |  |
| 12 | 12 | 1.3.3 | in relation to the current educational program, which will be allowed to rely on different points of view in the description and analysis of medical issues; |  |  | + |  |
| 12 | 12 | 1.3.4 | in the ability to use the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines/ issues without extending the educational program. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 1.4 | **Final learning outcomes** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 1.4.1 | The medical institution of education **must** determine the *expected learning outcomes* that students should manifest upon completion, regarding: |  |  |  |  |
| 13 | 13 |  | their achievements at a basic level in terms of  knowledge, skills and abilities; |  | + |  |  |
| 14 | 14 |  | an appropriate basis for a future career in any medical  area; |  | + |  |  |
| 15 | 15 |  | their future roles in the health sector; |  | + |  |  |
| 16 | 16 |  | student’s subsequent postgraduate training; |  | + |  |  |
| 17 | 17 |  | student’s commitment to lifelong learning; |  | + |  |  |
| 18 | 18 |  | health and sanitary needs, healthcare system needs and other aspects of social responsibility. |  | + |  |  |
| 19 | 19 | 1.4.2 | Medical educational organization **must** ensure that the student fulfills obligations of proper behavior towards doctors, teachers, patients and their relatives in accordance with the appropriate behavioral norms. |  | + |  |  |
| 20 | 20 | 1.4.3 | Medical institution of education should determine and coordinate the connection of the final learning outcomes, required on completion, with those required in post-graduate education; |  | + |  |  |
| 21 | 21 | 1.4.4 | Medical institution of education **should** determine the results of students’ involvement in conducting medical  research; |  | + |  |  |
| 22 | 22 | 1.4.5 | Medical institution of educat**ion should** pay attention to the outcomes related to global health. |  | + |  |  |
| 23 | 23 | 1.4.6 | Medical educational organization **should** use the assessment results of graduates' competencies as a  feedback tool to improve the educational program. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | ***Total*** | **0** | **22** | **1** |  |
|  |  | 2 | **EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 2.1 | **Academic program model and learning methods** |  |  |  |  |
| 24 | 1 | 2.1.1 | The medical institution of education should define an *educational program*, including an integrated model based on disciplines, systems of bodies, clinical problems and diseases, a model *based on a modular or spiral design.* |  | + |  |  |
| 25 | 2 | 2.1.2 | The medical institution of education **must** determine the *teaching and learning* methods used that encourage, train and support students in taking responsibility for their educational process. |  | + |  |  |
| 26 | 3 | 2.1.3 | The medical institution of education **should** ensure that the academic program develops students' lifelong learning abilities. |  | + |  |  |
| 27 | 4 | 2.1.4 | Medical institution of education **must** ensure that the academicprogramis implemented in accordance with the *principles of equality*. |  |  | + |  |
| 28 | 5 | 2.1.5 | Medical institution of education should use teaching and learning methods based on the modern theory of adult education. |  |  | + |  |
|  |  | 2.2 | **Scientific method** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 2.2.1 | Throughout the entire program of study, the medical institution of education should teach students: |  |  |  |  |
| 29 | 6 |  | principles of scientific methodology, including methods of analytical and critical thinking; |  | + |  |  |
| 30 | 7 |  | scientific research methods in medicine; |  | + |  |  |
| 31 | 8 |  | evidence-based medicine, |  | + |  |  |
| 32 | 9 |  | *which requires the appropriate competence of teachers and will be a compulsory part of the educational program.* |  | + |  |  |
| 32 | 10 | 2.2.2 | Medical educational organization **should** include in the academic program *elements of basic or applied research* for the formation of scientific thinking and the application of scientific research methods. |  | + |  |  |
| 33 | 11 | 2.2.3 | Medical institution of education should promote the involvement of students in conducting or participating in research projects. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | **Basic biomedical sciences** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should** define and  include in the educational program: |  |  |  |  |
| 35 | 12 | 2.3.1 | achievements of *basic biomedical sciences* to develop students' understanding of scientific knowledge; |  | + |  |  |
| 36 | 13 | 2.3.2 | concepts and methods that are fundamental to the acquisition and application of clinical scientific  knowledge. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should** in the academic program adjust and introduce new achievements of biomedical sciences for: |  |  |  |  |
| 37 | 14 | 2.3.3 | scientific, technological and clinical developments; |  | + |  |  |
| 38 | 15 | 2.3.4 | current and expected needs of the community and the health care system. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 2.4 | **Behavioral and social sciences and medical ethics** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 2.4.1 | Medical institution of education **must** determine and include in the academic program the achievements of: |  |  |  |  |
| 39 | 16 |  | *behavioral sciences;* |  | + |  |  |
| 40 | 17 |  | *social sciences;* |  | + |  |  |
| 41 | 18 |  | *medical ethics;* |  | + |  |  |
| 42 | 19 |  | *medical jurisprudence,*  which will provide the knowledge, concepts, methods, skills and attitudes necessary to understand the socioeconomic, demographic and cultural conditions, causes, distribution and consequences of medical health problems, as well as knowledge about the national health system and patient rights, which will facilitate the analysis of public health problems, effective communication, clinical decision making and ethical practice. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 2.4.2 | The medical educational organization **should** adjust and introduce new achievements in the *behavioral* and *social* sciences and also *medical ethics* for: |  |  |  |  |
| 43 | 20 |  | scientific, technological and clinical developments; |  | + |  |  |
| 44 | 21 |  | current and expected needs of the community and the health care system. |  | + |  |  |
| 45 | 22 |  | changing demographic and cultural conditions. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 2.5 | **Clinical sciences and skills** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | The medical institution of education **should** in the academic program define and implement the achievements of *clinical sciences* and ensure that  students: |  |  |  |  |
| 46 | 23 | 2.5.1 | acquire sufficient knowledge, *clinical* and *professional* skills to assume *appropriate responsibilities, including activities related to health promotion, disease prevention and patient care;* |  | + |  |  |
| 47 | 24 | 2.5.2 | conduct a reasonable part (one third) of the program in scheduled contact with patients, including review of the goal, of the appropriate number and their adequacy for training in the relevant clinical bases; |  | + |  |  |
| 48 | 25 | 2.5.3 | carry out work on health promotion and prevention. |  | + |  |  |
| 49 | 26 | 2.5.4 | The medical institution of education **must** establish a certain amount of time for training of the *main clinical disciplines, including internal diseases, surgery, psychiatry, general medical practice (family medicine), obstetrics and gynecology, pediatrics*. |  | + |  |  |
| 50 | 27 | 2.5.5 | The medical institution of education **should** organize clinical training with appropriate attention to patient *safety, including monitoring the activities performed by the student in a clinical setting*. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | The medical institution of education should adjust and introduce new clinical science achievements in the academic program for: |  |  |  |  |
| 51 | 28 | 2.5.6 | scientific, technological and clinical developments; |  | + |  |  |
| 52 | 29 | 2.5.7 | current and expected needs of the community and the health care system. |  | + |  |  |
| 53 | 30 | 2.5.8 | The medical institution of education should ensure that every student has *early contact with real patients, including his gradual participation in assisting the patient, including responsibility for the examination and/or treatment of the patient under supervision, which is carried out in appropriate clinical bases.* |  | + |  |  |
| 54 | 31 | 2.5.9 | The medical institution of education **should** structure the various components of clinical skills in accordance with the specific stage of the training program. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 2.6 | **Structure of the educational program, content and duration** |  |  |  |  |
| 55 | 32 | 2.6.1 | The medical institution of education **should** give a description of the content, scope and sequence of courses and other elements of the academic program in order to ensure that the appropriate proportions between the basic biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical disciplines is observed. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | The medical institution of education should in the  academic program: |  |  |  |  |
| 56 | 33 | 2.6.2 | provide horizontal integration of related sciences and disciplines; |  | + |  |  |
| 57 | 34 | 2.6.3 | provide vertical integration of clinical sciences with basic biomedical, behavioral and social sciences; |  | + |  |  |
| 58 | 35 | 2.6.4 | provide the possibility of elective content (electives) and determine the balance between the *compulsory and elective* parts of the educational program, *including a combination of compulsory elements and electives or special components of choice;* |  | + |  |  |
| 59 | 36 | 2.6.5 | determine the *relationship with complementary medicine, including non-traditional, traditional or alternative practice*. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | **2.7** | **Program management** |  |  |  |  |
| 60 | 37 | 2.7.1 | The medical institution of education must determine the structural unit responsible for the medical institution of education, which, under the academic leadership, shall be responsible *and have the authority* to plan and implement the educational program, *including the allocation of given resources for planning and introduction of teaching and learning methods, students, academic program and learning courses assessment in order to achieve the final learning*  *outcomes.* |  |  |  |  |
| 61 | 38 | 2.7.2 | Medical institution of education **must** guarantee representation of teachers and students in the structural unit responsible for educational programs. |  | + |  |  |
| 62 | 39 | 2.7.3 | Medical institution of education **should**, through the structural unit, responsible for educational programs, plan and implement innovations in the educational program. |  | + |  |  |
| 63 | 40 | 2.7.4 | Medical institution of education **should** include representatives from other relevant stakeholders, in the structure of the medical institution of education responsible for educational programs, including other participants of the learning process, representatives from clinical sites, graduates of medical institution of education, health professionals involved in the training process or other faculty members of the university. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 2.8 | **The link with medical practice and health care system** |  |  |  |  |
| 64 | 41 | 2.8.1 | The medical institution of education **should** provide an operational link between the academic program and the subsequent stages of vocational training (internship, specialization, CPD/CME) or practice that the student will begin after graduation*, including defining health problems and required learning outcomes, clearly determining and describing elements of medical institution of education and their links at various stages of training and practice, with due regard to local, national, regional and global conditions, and also feedback to/from the health sector and the participation of teachers and students in the work of a team of specialists in the provision of medical aid*. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should** ensure that the structural unit responsible for the educational program: |  |  |  |  |
| 65 | 42 | 2.8.2 | takes into account the particular conditions in which graduates have to work and modify the academic program accordingly; | + |  |  |  |
| 66 | 43 | 2.8.3 | reviews the modification of the academic program based on feedback from the public and society as a  whole. | + |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | ***Total*** | **3** | **38** | **2** |  |
|  |  | 3. | **STUDENTS ASSESSMENT** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 3.1 | **Assessment methods** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must**: |  |  |  |  |
| 67 | 1 | 3.1.1 | determine, approve and publish the *principles, methods and practices used to assess students*, *including the number of exams and other tests, the balance between the written and oral exams, the use of assessment methods based on criteria and reasoning, and special exams (CSVE or the Mini-clinical exam),* as well as determine the criteria for setting passing scores, grades and the number of allowed retakes; |  | + |  |  |
| 68 | 2 | 3.1.2 | ensure that the assessment covers knowledge, skills and attitudes to learning; |  | + |  |  |
| 69 | 3 | 3.1.3 | use a wide range of assessment methods and formats depending on their *“utility assessment”, which includes a combination of validity, reliability, impact on training, acceptability and effectiveness of methods and format of assessment;* |  | + |  |  |
| 70 | 4 | 3.1.4 | guarantee that assessment methods and results avoid conflicts of interest; |  | + |  |  |
| 71 | 5 | 3.1.5 | ensure that the evaluation process and methods are  open (accessible) for inspection by external experts; |  | + |  |  |
| 72 | 6 | 3.1.6 | use the system to appeal the assessment results. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should**: |  |  |  |  |
| 73 | 7 | 3.1.7 | document and evaluate the reliability and validity of evaluation methods, which requires an appropriate process to ensure the quality of existing assessment practices; |  | + |  |  |
| 74 | 8 | 3.1.8 | introduce the new, demand-driven assessment  methods; |  | + |  |  |
| 75 | 9 | 3.1.9 | use the system to appeal the assessment results. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 3.2 | **The link between assessment and learning** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must** *use the principles, methods and practice of assessment, including students’ learning achievements and assessment of knowledge, skills, professional values of relationships that:* |  |  |  |  |
| 76 | 10 | 3.2.1 | clearly comparable with the learning and teaching  outcomes; |  | + |  |  |
| 77 | 11 | 3.2.2 | guarantee that students achieve final learning  outcomes; |  | + |  |  |
| 78 | 12 | 3.2.3 | promote learning; |  | + |  |  |
| 79 | 13 | 3.2.4 | provide an appropriate balance between formative and summative assessment in order to manage learning and *evaluate the student’s academic progress, which requires the establishment of rules for assessing progress and their links with the assessment process.* |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should**: |  |  |  |  |
| 80 | 14 | 3.2.5 | *regulate the number and nature of examinations* of the various elements of the academic program in order to facilitate the acquisition of knowledge and *integrated learning and to avoid adverse effects on the learning process and eliminate the need to study excessive amounts of information and overload of the educational program;* |  | + |  |  |
| 81 | 15 | 3.2.6 | guarantee the provision of timely, precise, constructive and fair feedback to students based on the assessment outcomes. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | ***Total*** | **0** | **15** | **0** |  |
|  |  | 4. | **STUDENTS** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 4.1 | **Admission and selection policy** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must**: |  |  |  |  |
| 82 | 1 | 4.1.1 | define and implement an *admission policy* including a *clear setting for students selection;* |  | + |  |  |
| 83 | 2 | 4.1.2 | have *a policy and* introduce *the practice of admitting students with disabilities in accordance with applicable laws and regulatory documents of the country;* |  | + |  |  |
| 84 | 3 | 4.1.3 | have a policy and introduce the practice of transferring students from other programs and medical institution of education. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should**: |  |  |  |  |
| 85 | 4 | 4.1.4 | establish the links between the students’ selection and the mission of the medical institution of education, the academic program and the desired quality of graduates; |  | + |  |  |
| 86 | 5 | 4.1.5 | periodically review admission policies based on the relevant data from the public and professionals in order to satisfy the health *demands of the population and society as a whole, including review of student enrollment taking into account their gender, ethnicity and language, and the potential need for special admission policies for the low income students and national minorities*; |  | + |  |  |
| 87 | 6 | 4.1.6 | use the system to appeal admission decisions. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 4.2 | **Student recruitment** |  |  |  |  |
| 88 | 7 | 4.2.1 | The medical institution of education **must** determine the number of enrolled students in accordance with the material and technical capabilities at all stages of education and training, and making decisions on the recruitment of students implies the need to regulate national requirements for human resources for healthcare when medical institutions of education do not control the number of recruited students, then responsibilities should be demonstrated by explaining all relations, paying attention to the consequences of the decisions made (imbalance between the student enrollment and the material, technical and academic potential of the university). |  | + |  |  |
| 89 | 8 | 4.2.2 | Medical institution of education **should** periodically review the number and admitted students’ population in consultation with *the relevant stakeholders responsible for planning and developing human resources in the health sector, as well as with experts and organizations on global aspects of human health resources (such as insufficient and uneven distribution of human resources in healthcare, migration of doctors, the opening of new medical institutions of higher education) and introduce regulations to meet the health needs of the population and society as a whole.* |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 4.3 | **Student counseling and support** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must**: |  |  |  |  |
| 90 | 1 | 4.3.1 | have a system of *academic counseling for its students, which includes issues related to the choice of electives, preparation for postgraduate education, career planning, appointment of academic mentors (supervisors) for individual students or small groups of students;* |  | + |  |  |
| 91 | 2 | 4.3.2 | offer a student support program aimed at *social, financial and personal needs, which includes support due to social and personal problems and events, health and financial problems, access to medical care, immunization programs and health insurance, as well as financial assistance services in the form of material assistance, scholarships and loans* |  | + |  |  |
| 92 | 3 | 4.3.3 | allocate resources to support students; |  | + |  |  |
| 93 | 4 | 4.3.4 | ensure confidentiality regarding counseling and support. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should** provide  counseling: |  |  |  |  |
| 94 | 5 | 4.3.5 | based on monitoring of student progress and addressing students' social and personal needs, including academic support, support for personal problems and situations, health problems, financial  issues; |  | + |  |  |
| 95 | 6 | 4.3.6 | includes counseling and career planning. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 4.4 | **Student representation** |  |  |  |  |
| 96 | 7 | 4.4.1 | Medical institution of education **must** determine and implement *the policy of student representation and their respective participation* in the definition of the mission, the development, management and evaluation of the educational program, and other students related  issues. |  | + |  |  |
| 97 | 8 | 4.4.2 | Medical institutions of education **should** promote and *support student activities and student organizations, including the provision of technical and financial support to student organizations.* |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | **Total** | **0** | **16** | **0** |  |
|  |  | 5. | **ACADEMIC STAFF/ TEACHERS** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 5.1 | **Selection and Recruitment Policy** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must** determine and implement a *policy of selection and admission of employees*, which: |  |  |  |  |
| 98 | 1 | 5.1.1 | determines their category, responsibility and *balance of teaching staff/teachers* of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences and clinical sciences for the adequate implementation of the educational program, including the proper link between medical and non-medical teachers, full-time and part-time teachers, and the balance between academic and non-academic staff; |  | + |  |  |
| 99 | 2 | 5.1.2 | contains criteria for the scientific, pedagogical, and clinical merits of applicants, including the appropriate balance between pedagogical, scientific, and clinical qualifications; |  | + |  |  |
| 100 | 3 | 5.1.3 | identifies and monitors the responsibilities of teaching staff/ teachers of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences and clinical sciences. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should** in its policy for the selection and reception of staff to consider such criteria as: |  |  |  |  |
| 101 | 4 | 5.1.4 | relation to its mission, *significance of local conditions, including gender, nationality, religion, language and other conditions related to the medical institution of education and educational program;* |  | + |  |  |
| 102 | 5 | 5.1.5 | *economic opportunities that take into account the institutional conditions for financing employees and the efficient use of resources.* |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 5.2 | **Development policy and employee activities** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **mus**t determine and implement the policy of the activities and development of employees, which: |  |  |  |  |
| 104 | 6 | 5.2.1 | allows to maintain *a balance* between teaching, *scientific and service functions, which include the establishment of time for each activity, taking into account the needs of the medical institution of education and professional qualifications of teachers;* |  | + |  |  |
| 105 | 7 | 5.2.2 | guarantees *deserved recognition of its academic activities,* with an appropriate focus on pedagogical, research and clinical qualifications, and is *carried out in the form of awards, promotion and/or remuneration*; |  | + |  |  |
| 106 | 8 | 5.2.3 | ensures that clinical activities and research are used in teaching and learning; |  | + |  |  |
| 107 | 9 | 5.2.4 | guarantees the *adequacy of knowledge by each employee of the educational program, which includes knowledge of the methods of teaching/learning and the general content of the educational program, and other disciplines and subject areas in order to encourage cooperation and integration;* |  | + |  |  |
| 108 | 10 | 5.2.5 | *includes training, development, support and evaluation of teachers, which involves all teachers, not only newly recruited, but also teachers from hospitals and clinics.* |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should**: |  |  |  |  |
| 109 | 11 | 5.2.6 | take into account the proportion of "teacher-student" depending on the various components of the educational program; |  | + |  |  |
| 110 | 12 | 5.2.7 | develop and implement employee promotion policy. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | **Total** | **1** | **11** | **0** |  |
|  |  | 6. | **EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 6.1 | **Material and technical base** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should**: |  |  |  |  |
| 111 | 1 | 6.1.1 | have a sufficient *material and technical base* for teachers and students to ensure adequate implementation of the educational program; |  | + |  |  |
| 112 | 2 | 6.1.2 | provide a *safe* environment for employees, students, patients and those who takes care of them, including provision of the necessary information and *protection from harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with safety regulations in the laboratory and while using the equipment.* |  | + |  |  |
| 113 | 3 | 6.1.3 | The medical institution of education **should** improve the student learning environment by regularly updating, expanding and strengthening the material and technical base, which should be consistent with the development in the learning practice. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 6.2 | **Clinical training resources** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | The medical institution of education **must** provide the necessary resources for students to acquire adequate clinical experience, including sufficient: |  |  |  |  |
| 114 | 4 | 6.2.1 | number and category of patients; |  |  | + |  |
| 115 | 5 | 6.2.2 | number and categories of clinical sites, *which include clinics, outpatient services (including primary health care), primary health care facilities, health centers and other institutions rendering medical care services to the population, and clinical skills centers / laboratories that allow to conduct clinical training, using the capabilities of clinical bases and ensure rotation on the main clinical disciplines* |  | + |  |  |
| 116 | 6 | 6.2.3 | observation of students' clinical practice. |  | + |  |  |
| 117 | 7 | 6.2.4 | Medical institution of education **should** *study and evaluate,* adapt and improve resources for clinical training to meet the needs of the population served, which will *include relevance and quality for clinical training programs regarding clinical sites, equipment, number and category of patients and clinical practice, observation as a supervisor and administration.* |  |  | + |  |
|  |  | 6.3 | **Information Technology** |  |  |  |  |
| 118 | 8 | 6.3.1 | Medical institution of education **must** determine and implement a policy that aims at *the effective use and evaluation of the relevant information and communication technologies in the educational program.* | + | + |  |  |
| 119 | 9 | 6.3.2 | Medical institution of education **must** provide access to network or other e-media outlets |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should** provide opportunities for teachers and students to use information and communication technologies: |  |  |  |  |
| 120 | 10 | 6.3.3 | for self-study; |  | + |  |  |
| 121 | 11 | 6.3.4 | access to information; |  | + |  |  |
| 122 | 12 | 6.3.5 | case management; |  | + |  |  |
| 123 | 13 | 6.3.6 | healthcare jobs. |  | + |  |  |
| 124 | 14 | 6.3.7 | Medical institution of education **should** ensure that students have access to relevant patient data and healthcare information systems. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 6.4 | **Medical research and scientific achievements** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must**: |  |  |  |  |
| 125 | 15 | 6.4.1 | have research activities in the field of medicine and scientific achievements as the basis for the educational program; |  | + |  |  |
| 126 | 16 | 6.4.2 | identify and implement a policy that promotes the link between the research and education; |  | + |  |  |
| 127 | 17 | 6.4.3 | provide information on the research base and priority areas in the field of scientific research of the medical institution of education; |  | + |  |  |
| 128 | 18 | 6.4.4 | use medical research as the basis for a study program |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institutions of education **should** guarantee that the link between research and education: |  |  |  |  |
| 129 | 19 | 6.4.5 | is taken into account in teaching; |  | + |  |  |
| 130 | 20 | 6.4.6 | encourages and trains students to participate in medical research and development. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 6.5 | **Inspection review in the field of education** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must**: |  |  |  |  |
| 131 | 21 | 6.5.1 | have access to *education related inspection reviews*, where necessary, and conduct such reviews that examine the processes, practices and problems of medical education and may involve doctors with experience in conducting research in medical education, psychologists and sociologists in the field of education, or involving experts from other national and international institutions. |  |  | + |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must** determine and implement a policy on the inspection reviews in the field of education: |  |  |  |  |
| 132 | 22 | 6.5.2 | in the development of an educational program; |  | + |  |  |
| 133 | 23 | 6.5.3 | in developing teaching methods and assessing knowledge and skills |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should**: |  |  |  |  |
| 134 | 24 | 6.5.4 | provide evidence of the internal or external inspection reviews in the field of medical education to develop the potential of employees; |  | + |  |  |
| 135 | 25 | 6.5.5 | pay due attention to the development *of inspection reviews in education related evaluations and research in medical education as a discipline, including the study of theoretical, practical and social issues in medical education;* |  | + |  |  |
| 136 | 26 | 6.5.6 | promote the aspirations and interests of staff in  conducting research on medical education. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 6.6 | **Exchange in education** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education must define and  implement a policy for: |  |  |  |  |
| 137 | 27 | 6.6.1 | cooperation at the national and international levels  with *other medical institutions of higher education;* |  | + |  |  |
| 138 | 28 | 6.6.2 | the *transfer and offsetting of studying credits*, which includes review of the scope limits of the educational program, which may be transferred from other educational organizations and which may be facilitated by concluding agreements on mutual recognition of **academic program** elements and active coordination of programs between medical institutions of education as well as the use of a transparent system of credits and  flexible course requirements. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should**: |  |  |  |  |
| 139 | 29 | 6.6.3 | promote regional and international exchange of staff (academic, administrative and teaching staff) and students by providing appropriate resources; |  | + |  |  |
| 140 | 30 | 6.6.4 | guarantee that the exchange is organized in accordance with the objectives, taking into account the needs of employees, students, and with respect for ethical principles. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | **Total** | **0** | **27** | **3** |  |
|  |  | 7. | **PROGRAM EVALUATION** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 7.1 | **Program monitoring and evaluation mechanisms** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must** |  |  |  |  |
| 141 | 1 | 7.1.1 | have a process and outcome *monitoring program* that stipulates *collection and analysis of data on key aspects of the academic program in order to ensure that the educational process is implemented appropriately and to identify any areas that require interventions, as well as collection of data which is part of the administrative procedures associated with students admission, assessment and completion of training*. |  | + |  |  |
| 142 | 2 | 7.1.2 | control that the relevant assessment results affect the curriculum |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | The medical institution of education **must** establish and apply mechanisms for evaluation of the educational program, which |  |  |  |  |
| 143 | 3 | 7.1.3 | is focused on the academic progra**m** and its *main components, including the model of the educational program, the structure, content and duration of the educational program, and the use of compulsory and elective parts;* |  | + |  |  |
| 144 | 4 | 7.1.4 | student progress centered; |  | + |  |  |
| 145 | 5 | 7.1.5 | identify and review *problems that include the lack of achievement of the expected learning outcomes*, and will assume that the information received about the learning outcomes, including on the identified deficiencies and problems, will be used as feedback for activities and corrective action plans to improve the  academic program and disciplines curriculum; |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should**  periodically conduct a comprehensive evaluation of the educational program, focused on: |  |  |  |  |
| 146 | 6 | 7.1.6 | the *context of the educational process*, which includes the organization and resources, the learning environment and the culture of the medical institution of education; |  | + |  |  |
| 147 | 7 | 7.1.7 | *special components of the educational program*, which include a description of the discipline and methods of teaching and learning, clinical rotations and assessment methods; |  | + |  |  |
| 148 | 8 | 7.1.8 | *general outcomes*, which will be measured based on the national exams, international exams, career choices and postgraduate studies; | + |  |  |  |
| 149 | 9 | 7.1.9 | Medical institution of education **should** rely on social responsibility/accountability. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 7.2 | **Teacher and student feedback** |  |  |  |  |
| 150 | 10 | 7.2.1 | The medical institution of education **must** systematically collect, analyze, and provide teachers and students *with feedback that includes information about the process and products of the educational program, and also contains information about unfair practices or improper behavior of teachers or students with and/or legal consequences.* |  | + |  |  |
| 151 | 11 | 7.2.2 | Medical institution of education **should** use feedback results to improve the educational program. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 7.3 | **Students’ learning performance** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should** analyzethe *educational achievements of students and graduates* in relation to: |  |  |  |  |
| 152 | 12 | 7.3.1 | its *mission and learning outcomes* of the educational program, which contains information on the average duration of studies, grades, the frequency of passing and failures in examinations, cases of successful completion and deduction, students' reports on the conditions of training in the completed courses, the time spent to study areas of interest, including on elective components, as well as interviews with students on the repeat courses, and interviews with students who quit from their studies; |  | + |  |  |
| 153 | 13 | 7.3.2 | educational program; |  | + |  |  |
| 154 | 14 | 7.3.3. | availability of resources. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should** analyze the *students' studying achievements* regarding: |  |  |  |  |
| 155 | 15 | 7.3.4 | their *prior experience and conditions, including social, economic, cultural conditions;* |  | + |  |  |
| 156 | 16 | 7.3.5 | level of training at the time of admission to the medical institution of education. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should** use the analysis of students' studying achievements to provide feedback to the structural units responsible for: |  |  |  |  |
| 157 | 17 | 7.3.6 | students selection; |  | + |  |  |
| 158 | 18 | 7.3.7 | academic program planning; |  | + |  |  |
| 159 | 19 | 7.3.8 | students consulting. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 7.4 | **Stakeholder involvement** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education in its program of monitoring and evaluation of the **a**cademic program **must** involve: |  |  |  |  |
| 160 | 20 | 7.4.1 | teaching staff and students; | + |  |  |  |
| 161 | 21 | 7.4.2 | its administration and management. | + |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | *For other stakeholders, including other representatives of academic and administrative staff, members of the public, authorized education and health authorities, professional organizations, as well as those responsible for post-graduate education*, medical institution of education **should**: |  |  |  |  |
| 162 | 22 | 7.4.3 | provide access to the evaluation results of the course and educational program; |  | + |  |  |
| 163 | 23 | 7.4.4 | collect and study feedback from them on the clinical practice of graduates; |  | + |  |  |
| 164 | 24 | 7.4.5 | collect and study feedback from them on the educational program. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | ***Total*** | **1** | **23** | **0** |  |
|  |  | 8. | **MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 8.1 | **Management** |  |  |  |  |
| 165 | 1 | 8.1.1 | Medical institution of education **must** determine the management structures and functions, including their *links with the university, if the medical institution of education is affiliated with or a branch of the university.* |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should** in their management structures determine the structural units with the establishment of the responsibility of each structural unit and include in their composition: |  |  |  |  |
| 166 | 2 | 8.1.2 | representatives of teaching staff; |  | + |  |  |
| 167 | 3 | 8.1.3 | students; |  | + |  |  |
| 168 | 4 | 8.1.4 | *other stakeholders* including *representatives from the ministry of education and health, the healthcare*  *industry and the public.* |  | + |  |  |
| 169 | 5 | 8.1.5 | Medical institution of education **should** ensure the transparency of the management system and decisions that are published in bulletins, posted on the website of the higher education institution, included in the protocols for review and implementation. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 8.2 | **Academic leadership** |  |  |  |  |
| 170 | 6 | 8.2.1 | Medical institution of education **must** clearly define the responsibility of *academic leadership* in the development and management of the educational program. |  | + |  |  |
| 171 | 7 | 8.2.2 | Medical institution of education **should** periodically assess academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and the final study results. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 8.3 | **Budget for learning and resource allocation** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must**: |  |  |  |  |
| 172 | 8 | 8.3.1 | have a clear set of responsibilities and authorities to provide the academic program with resources, including a targeted budget for training; |  | + |  |  |
| 173 | 9 | 8.3.2 | allocate resources necessary for the implementation of the academic program and distribute educational resources in accordance with the correspondent needs. |  | + |  |  |
| 174 | 10 | 8.3.3 | The system of financing the medical institution of education should be based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, responsibility, differentiation and independence of all levels of budgets. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should**: |  |  |  |  |
| 175 | 11 | 8.3.4 | provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including a decent remuneration of teachers in order to achieve the final learning outcomes; |  | + |  |  |
| 176 | 12 | 8.3.5 | in the allocation of resources, take into account scientific advances in medicine and the problems of public health and correspondent needs. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 8.4 | **Administrative staff and management** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must** *have the appropriate administrative staff, including their number and composition in correspondence with the qualifications,* in order to*:* |  |  |  |  |
| 177 | 13 | 8.4.1 | ensure the implementation of the academic program and relevant activities; |  | + |  |  |
| 178 | 14 | 8.4.2 | guarantee proper management and allocation of  resources. |  | + |  |  |
| 179 | 15 | 8.4.3 | The medical institution of education **should** develop and implement an internal quality assurance management program, including review of the needs for improvement, and conduct regular management review and analysis. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  | 8.5 | **Interaction with the healthcare sector** |  |  |  |  |
| 180 | 16 | 8.5.1 | Medical institution of education **must** develop a *constructive interaction* with the healthcare sector, with related health industries at the society and the government levels, *including the exchange of information, cooperation and initiatives of the organization, which contributes to the provision of qualified doctors in accordance with the needs of*  *society.* | + |  |  |  |
| 181 | 17 | 8.5.2 | Medical institution of education **should** be given an official *status of cooperation* with partners in the healthcare sector, which *includes the conclusion of formal agreements with the definition of the content and forms of cooperation and/or concluding a joint contract and the establishment of a coordinating committee, and joint activities.* | **+** |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | ***Total*** | **2** | **15** | **0** |  |
|  |  | 9. | **CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT** |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **must** as a dynamic and socially responsible institution: |  |  |  |  |
| 181 | 1 | 9.1.1 | initiate procedures for regular review and revision of the content, results/competences, assessment and learning environment, structures and functions, document and correct deficiencies; |  | + |  |  |
| 182 | 2 | 9.1.2 | allocate resources for continuous improvement. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | Medical institution of education **should**: |  |  |  |  |
| 183 | 3 | 9.1.3 | base the update process on prospective studies and  analysis and on the results of own research, evaluation, and medical education related literature; |  | + |  |  |
| 184 | 4 | 9.1.4 | guarantee that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to a revision of its policy and practice in accordance with previous experience, current activities and future prospects; direct the update process to the following |  | + |  |  |
| 185 | 5 | 9.1.5 | Adaptation of the Regulations on the mission and final outcomes to the scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of society. |  | + |  |  |
| 186 | 6 | 9.1.6 | Modification of graduates' final learning outcomes in accordance with the documented needs of the postgraduate training environment, including clinical skills, training in public health issues and participation in the process of providing medical care to patients in accordance with the duties assigned to graduates after graduation. |  | + |  |  |
| 187 | 7 | 9.1.7 | Adaptation of the academic program model and methodological approaches to ensure that they are relevant and appropriate and take into account modern theories in education, the methodology of adult education, the principles of active learning. |  | + |  |  |
| 188 | 8 | 9.1.8 | Correction of the elements of the academic program and their interrelation in accordance with achievements in the biomedical, behavioral, social and clinical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and health status/morbidity structure of the population and socio-economic and cultural conditions, and the adjustment process will ensure the inclusion of new relevant knowledge, concepts and methods, and the elimination of outdated ones. |  | + |  |  |
| 189 | 9 | 9.1.9 | Development of evaluation principles, and methods of conducting and the number of examinations in accordance with changes in the final learning outcomes and methods of teaching and learning. |  | + |  |  |
| 190 | 10 | 9.1.10 | Adaptation of a student recruitment policy and student selection methods taking into account changing expectations and circumstances, needs for human resources, changes in the pre-university education system and the demands of the academic program . |  | + |  |  |
| 191 | 11 | 9.1.11 | Adaptation of a recruitment policy and the formation of academic staff in accordance with changing needs. |  | + |  |  |
| 192 | 12 | 9.1.12 | Upgrading educational resources to meet changing needs, such as student enrollment, a number and profile of academic staff, an academic program. |  | + |  |  |
| 193 | 13 | 9.1.13 | Improving the process of monitoring and evaluation of the educational program. |  | + |  |  |
| 194 | 14 | 9.1.14 | Improving the organizational structure and management principles to ensure effective operations in a changing circumstances and needs, and, in the long term, to meet the interests of various groups of stakeholders. |  | + |  |  |
|  |  |  | ***Total*** | **0** | **14** | **0** |  |
|  |  |  | **GRAND TOTAL** | **7** | **181** | **6** |  |